Reviewer's report

Title: Linear accelerator-based stereotactic radiosurgery in 140 brain metastases from malignant melanoma

Version: 3 Date: 30 March 2015

Reviewer: Grace Kim

Reviewer's report:

The question posed by the authors of describing their results of SRS for melanoma brain mets is well defined. The methods are appropriate and well described. The data is sound. The figures are appropriate

The discussion is the strength of the article. Limitations of the work are briefly stated. Writing is acceptable with some minor revisions for grammar needed.

Major revisions: Authors need to further highlight how their article is original and novel as well as provide a more comprehensive critique of their methods.

Minor revisions: - multiple grammar mistakes some of which -- page 7-- line 15 - finding - find, line 18 - reported 2011, line 20 had single BM,

Level of interest: An article of limited interest

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Statistical review: Yes, but I do not feel adequately qualified to assess the statistics.

Declaration of competing interests:

none