Reviewer’s report

Title: Linear accelerator-based stereotactic radiosurgery in 140 brain metastases from malignant melanoma

Version: 3 Date: 20 March 2015

Reviewer: Samuel Chao

Reviewer’s report:

This is a sizable series of patients treated for brain metastases from melanoma. While there are larger series as outlined well in the discussion section, I believe it still adds value to existing literature on this subject.

Major Compulsory Revisions:

The discussion section needs to be better organized. It has all the essential details, but can be shortened to improve readability. The literature review can be compared and summarized in a table. It is hard for the reader to keep in mind all the values and to be able to compare in their head how the authors’ series of patients compare to existing literature.

That said, I do like that the authors provide such a comprehensive review to make it a good reference for future literature.

Minor Essential Revisions:

There are a few errors in the manuscript. First, the authors will need to change the p-value from p=0.000 to p<0.001.

Page 4, line 5, counties should be countries I believe.

Reference #15 is incomplete. The remaining authors and volume/page information is missing.

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

I have no competing interests.