Reviewer’s report

**Title:** Linear accelerator-based stereotactic radiosurgery in 140 brain metastases from malignant melanoma

**Version:** 3  **Date:** 27 December 2014

**Reviewer:** Dominique L. Rash

**Reviewer’s report:**

This paper investigated the outcome and treatment side effects from SRS used to treat brain metastases secondary to malignant melanoma. As a retrospective chart review they were successful in reporting the overall survival and tumor remission rates for 84 patients included in the analysis.

Discretionary revisions:

Given that some patients had multiple brain metastases, it would be interesting to know whether the response of the tumors in a single patient was consistent—for example, with three tumors in a single patient, did all three experience a complete response? Or was the response mixed? Presumably there are features unique to the individual’s tumor, but consistent among multiple brain mets which influence the response to therapy.

Within table 1, the number of patients described or listed under the Clark’s level category appears to exceed 84.

Minor Essential Revisions

I would like to see a clearer description of the limitations of the study.

Would it be possible to comment on the frequency of follow up imaging?

Did patients who progressed receive additional therapy to account for the longer than expected median OS?

Major Compulsory Revisions

None.

**Level of interest:** An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

**Quality of written English:** Acceptable

**Statistical review:** Yes, but I do not feel adequately qualified to assess the statistics.

**Declaration of competing interests:**
I declare I have no competing interests