Reviewer's report

Title: Clusterin transcript variants expression in thyroid tumour: a potential marker of malignancy?

Version: 4 Date: 3 March 2015

Reviewer: Theodore Nowicki

Reviewer's report:

The manuscript by Fuzio et al describes some preliminary, but exciting data regarding differential expression of CLU2 and CLU1 in normal vs malignant thyroid tissue. The authors further demonstrate how the significant variation in relative expression of CLU2 compared to CLU1 appears to predict malignant potential in retrospective analyses of adenoma/cancerous thyroid tissue when compared to patient-matched normal thyroid controls, as well as in the study population’s FNA biopsies. While the study size is small, the data are compelling.

Minor Essential Revisions:
1. The manuscript would significantly benefit from additional English language copy editing.

Discretionary Revisions:
2. It would be of interest to this reviewer if the authors included data regarding the patients’ progression of disease (presence of nodal and/or distant metastasis, subsequent recurrence of disease, death, etc.), and comment on any trends in CLU2/CLU1 expression variances which perhaps correlate as prognostic factors. However, this reviewer recognizes that such information may be limited by the small study size, and may indeed be beyond the scope of the manuscript (which merely seeks to demonstrate potential utility as a diagnostic, rather than prognostic biomarker).

3. Figure 4A would possibly be more clear if it were rendered in the bar/error-bar format of the other figures (or with range/error bar rendering instead). This is a purely stylistic recommendation, however.

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:
I declare that I have no competing interests.