Reviewer's report

Title: Clinical analysis of liver transplantation for hepatocellular and cholangiocellular carcinoma

Version: 3  Date: 12 September 2014

Reviewer: Joanna Moschandreas

Reviewer's report:

- Major Compulsory Revisions

1. The number of patients is too small to justify the use of multivariable models and the estimates presented are likely to be biased (see eg Bradburn et al 2003 doi:10.1038/sj.bjc.6601120, Martin Bland “An introduction to medical statistics 3rd ed, OUP pg 325). Table 2 and its discussion need to be removed from the article.

2. Assuming that the control group records were selected from the same pool as the OLT group, a comparison of the survival pattern in the two patient groups (OLT vs controls) should be presented. The information presented in lines 85 to 118 could be presented in tabular form, so it can easily be seen whether the two groups are comparable initially. It is reported that the survival curve of the total group of patients (n=29) is presented in Figure 1. Similarly all patients should be included in the univariate comparisons presented (which should also include an OLT-control group comparison).

- Minor Essential Revisions

1. Title. The letter “a” is missing from the last word. “… carcinoma”

2. Figure 1 legend. “…survival of patients in the combined hepatocellular and cholangiocellular carcinoma group and the control group”. Both groups have cHCC-CC. Also, the curve itself does not appear to correspond to the percentage estimates stated the text e.g. at 1 year the estimated proportion surviving is 70% (line 155) in the OLT group and 0% in the control group (line 157).

3. Table 1. It appears that average survival is higher for those with cirrhosis (53 months vs 9 months) and for those with a lymph node metastasis (55 months vs 14 months). Check that the results presented are correct.

4. Provide further details of how the control group was selected in the Methods section

- Discretionary Revisions

1. Title. I would suggest amending the title to “Effect of liver transplantation in combined hepatocellular and cholangiocellular carcinoma”

Level of interest: An article of limited interest
Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: Yes, and I have assessed the statistics in my report.

Declaration of competing interests:
I declare that I have no competing interests.