Reviewer's report

Title: Clinical analysis of liver transplantation for hepatocellular and cholangiocellular carcinom

Version: 3 Date: 6 July 2014

Reviewer: Boris Kuvshinoff

Reviewer's report:

This is an interesting analysis of patients with Mixed IHC/HCC, mostly associated with Hep B and Cirrhosis. A clinically practical paper that can help delineate those that might benefit mose for OLT.

Major Compulsory Revisions:

1. Table 1 survival for LN mets, Major Vasc Inv, Cirrhosis are completely opposite what would be expected based on HR and the literature. I am very interested to know what the median survival and how many pts survived if they had + nodes, Major vasc invasion or both. The table seems incorrect. 35% recur in 1 year and over half within 2 years. Are these the pts with large tumors? nodes? MVI?

2. Please include 90-d mortality. OK to keep 30-d as well.

3. I would just remove the control group. It really adds nothing to the paper. Actually somewhat confusing and interrupts the flow of the manuscript. Acknowledgement that patients who are not offered resection will do poorly.

Minor Essential Revisions:

1) line 133. change to "suspected tumor recurrence"

2) line 155. 418% ??

3) line 211. could you provide what the survival was in ref 9 for hepatic resection, a good reference point.

4) line 229. confused on this. if lymph nodes enlarged you recommend liver bx?? not lymph node bx??

5) none of the patients had poorly differentiated tumors? only intermediate and well?

6) any data on the % of IHC vs. HCC? or at least what % was majority HCC vs IHC? did this have any survival difference??

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field
Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: Yes, but I do not feel adequately qualified to assess the statistics.