Reviewer's report

Title: Comparison of CLART HPV2 genotyping assay to Linear Array and Hybrid Capture 2: a split-sample study

Version: 1 Date: 17 December 2014

Reviewer: Darrel Cook

Reviewer's report:

This article compares the performance of two commercial HPV genotyping assays, CLART and Linear Array, against each other and the well-validated HC2 high-risk HPV screening assay, in a population of ~400 Danish women with abnormal cervical cytology. The article is clearly written, the research questions are well-defined and the data are sound. The findings of this study are similar to other reports in the literature with respect to these genotyping assays. The estimation of sensitivity and specificity of all three assays for CIN2 or greater diagnoses obtained over an average 17 month follow-up period is a strength of this paper, as many similar studies examine only analytical comparisons between assays. My major concern is related to the methodology description as noted below.

Major compulsory revision:

The authors state on several occasions that results were not statistically significantly different (e.g., lines 221, 224, 243, 246, 256, 262), but there is no description of the statistical methods used to arrive at these conclusions. The methods section should be updated to include the statistical tests/methods used. It would also be helpful to include the relevant p values in the results section.

Minor essential revision:

In line 116, it is stated that HC2 negative ASCUS cases are routinely downgraded to normal cytology. Later, in line 121 it is stated that women with persistent ASCUS are referred to colposcopy. This should be clarified. Does persistent ASCUS refer only to those HC2 positive and persistent? How is persistent ASCUS defined if an initial HC2 negative ASCUS smear is downgraded to normal and a later ASCUS result is obtained?

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:
I declare that I have no competing interests.