Author’s response to reviews

Title: Treatment and survival of non-alcoholic steatohepatitis associated hepatocellular carcinoma

Authors:

Arndt Weinmann (Arndt.Weinmann@unimedizin-mainz.de)
Yvonne Alt (yvonne.alt@unimedizin-mainz.de)
Sandra Koch (Sandra.Koch@unimedizin-mainz.de)
Carina Nelles (Carina.Nelles@unimedizin-mainz.de)
Christoph Düber (dueber@radiologie.klinik.uni-mainz.de)
Hauke Lang (Hauke.Lang@unimedizin-mainz.de)
Gerd Otto (Gerd.Otto@unimedizin-mainz.de)
Tim Zimmermann (tim.zimmermann@unimedizin-mainz.de)
Jens U Marquardt (Jens.Marquardt@unimedizin-mainz.de)
Peter R Galle (Peter.Galle@unimedizin-mainz.de)
Marcus A Wörns (Marcus-Alexander.Woerns@unimedizin-mainz.de)
Jörn M Schattenberg (schatten@uni-mainz.de)

Version: 3 Date: 1 March 2015

Author’s response to reviews: see over
Dear Prof. Dafne Solera,

Thank you for providing us with the positive evaluations of both reviewers. We have carefully reviewed the manuscript and included a point-to-point reply to reviewer 1 concerns which can be found below. The manuscript now contains a novel table 2 that depicts the differences in the subgroups of HCC and supports our previous findings. In addition we have made the changes as requested by the editorial team. The

I would hope that these changes will lead to a positive re-evaluation and am looking forward to hear from you.

Sincerely,

Jörn M. Schattenberg, MD
Point to Point reply

Reviewer 1
I think the perspective of this research is very good. However, the results of this paper are poor to trust and be applied in clinical works. The biggest problems are the large deviation of sample size and statistical methods. Therefore, to simply compare the mixed causes group with NASH-HCC, the statistical value is very low. These parameters between multiple groups and between every two groups should be compared and required.

Reviewer 1 raises concerns due to the sample sizes of the group of all-HCCs vs NASH-HCC and suggests comparing the parameters and clinical characteristics between the different aetiologies. We have now included a new table 2 that compares NASH HCC to alcoholic, HCV and HBV. The observations are in accordance with the previous findings. NASH-related HCC is significantly correlated with the presence of metabolic risk factors in this retrospective cohort. A corresponding section was included in the results section on page 7 (lane 22) to page 8 (lane 1).

Reviewer 2
Reviewer 2 underlines the importance of our findings and has no further reviewer comments.

Editor’s Request:
1) Please include the full name of the Ethics committee that approved the study
   The approving ethics committee was included in the methods section.
2) Please move the funding information to the Acknowledgments section.
   Funding information were moved to the acknowledgement section