Reviewer's report

Title: Gamma knife radiosurgery for elderly patients with brain metastasis: selection of scoring system as a prognostic factor

Version: 2
Date: 12 November 2014
Reviewer: Alberto Franzin

Reviewer's report:

This is a well conducted study on a not small number of patients.
- The Authors’ effort in addressing prognostic factors in the elderly population is noteworthy, especially considering increasing age and the socioeconomic impact of cancer in the overall population in our countries. I would like to see further developed in the discussion part the Authors’ opinion regarding how aggressive we can be in treating this subgroup of patients. I think this is a fundamental question to be answered. Especially important since little is add to what is already known and previously reported i.e. that K.P.S. (general clinical conditions) and extracranial metastases (degree of control of primary cancer) are some of the most important factors in predicting survival. This holds true for the oncologic patient per se, either young or old.
- Potential bias: vast majority of patients considered in good conditions: high K.P.S. (median 84), small number of cranial metastases (median 2).