Reviewer’s report

Title: Urinary N1, N12-diacetylspermine predicts tumor invasiveness in patients with clinical Stage IA non-small cell lung cancer

Version: 3 Date: 6 October 2014

Reviewer: Prasad Adusumilli

Reviewer’s report:

Major Compulsory revisions

This is a descriptive manuscript detailing the urinary diacetylspermine values in lung cancer patients.

Authors took a big leap of faith in claiming that this urine test predicts invasiveness in stage IA lung cancer patients, which is no way supported by their data.

Authors should be strongly consider to rewrite the manuscript with no definitive or novel claims except for the descriptive nature.

- Authors claim predictive ability, the data supports prognostic nature, but not predictiveness
- Does the data include consecutive patients or selected patients?
- Authors ignore sentinel publications while discussing limited resection versus lobectomy for stage IA lung cancer patients, for example..Nitadori et al JNCI 2013
- Discussion and conclusions should be toned down to reflect the data, claiming a predictive test for stage IA lung cancer by urinary test is beyond the data provide.

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: Yes, but I do not feel adequately qualified to assess the statistics.

Declaration of competing interests:

'I declare that I have no competing interests'