Reviewer's report

Title: Screening of exon 11 for BRCA1 using the High Resolution melting for diagnostic in Moroccan breast cancer patients

Version: 2
Date: 29 September 2014

Reviewer: Juliana Giacomazzi

Reviewer's report:

Major compulsory revisions:
1) to clarify the results of the study in the abstract. In the methods not include results, and in the conclusion specify why the HRM is "reliable and highly sensitive method for mutation scanning of MULTIPLE exons". The analysis was done only of exon 11;
2) The BRCA1 gene must be cited in italic;
3) The results must be separated of the discussion;
4) The ethical aspects must be cited together in the materials and methods;
5) The statistical analysis was not showed in the manuscript;
6) The HRM reagents must be cited in concentrations;
7) Which sequencing analyzer software was used? Specify
8) In materials and methods > patients, the authors cited the use of "two positive controls". Specify it. In the results the authors cited that used also negative controls (specify it in materials and methods)
9) In the discussion the authors cited that HRM is "sensitive, specific, cost-effective", however none analysis of it was done in the manuscript. Please verify.
10) The phrase "The primers were selected in order to analyze the whole exon 11 of BRCA1 gene, typically the region where we already had the positive control." must be included in the materials and methods. Specific which primers are used (the sequence) for HRM and for sequencing

Minor essential revisions:
1) Needs language corrections before being published;
2) See the resolution of the figures.
3) Paragraph 3 - "... its testing is now frequently used worldwide in women especially those with a (heavy family history), substitute by "breast and ovarian hereditary predisposition syndrome" (HBOC)
4) paragraph 5 don’t have references.

Level of interest: An article of limited interest
Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Statistical review: Yes, but I do not feel adequately qualified to assess the statistics.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests.