Reviewer’s report

Title: Local people's views on the evidence-based skilled-maternal-care in Mfuwe, Zambia: a qualitative study

Version: 0 Date: 17 Jan 2019

Reviewer: Jennifer Ayto

Reviewer's report:

Thank you for the opportunity to review the manuscript entitled Has the quest for evidence-based practice become pervasive in maternal health response in Sub Saharan Africa? the case of skilled maternal care in Mfuwe, Zambia. This study explores local people's views on the evidence-based skilled-maternal-care in Zambia using a case study- qualitative approach. It is an important study because it gives voice to the local people's views.

Title: perhaps review the title so that it is more succinct and includes the type of study. For example, The quest for skilled maternal care and evidence-based practice in Sub Saharan Africa: A qualitative case study

Or

Local people's views on the evidence-based skilled-maternal-care in Zambia: a qualitative case study

Abstract

Methods: include the theoretical framework here.

Findings: check the font as it looks like c) is different

Main body

- Theoretical framework should be heading not subheading
- Methods
- Start the Methods off with explaining the type of study
- Perhaps put ethics at the end of the methods section
Table 1 shows the summary of demographic and social characteristics of the participants. This needs to be in Results

Comment:

- Best to write numbers out in full especially when starting a sentence as it makes for easier reading.
- A recruitment subheading is needed
- How did you recruit the participants - did you contact them directly, speak with family members, obtained the names from birth lists, word of mouth? Use snowball techniques?
- Usually case studies draw on multiple data sources - common sources, including direct and indirect observations, field notes, documents, physical artefacts. Did you also collect any of these? If not just an explanation why you only used the focus groups?
- Did you do any one to one interview. 10 participants per focus group is quite large. A comment about the impact of this on data quality and how the groups worked together would be useful - this potentially is a bias.
- Data collection: an example of the some of the questions used -and include the topic guide as supplementary material.
- I assume the follow up questions where used as prompts?
- or where they more in-depth questions to explore something that you had identified?
- where the focus groups conducted in the participants house, community area, clinic?
- Time frame for recruitment?
- How did you identify the participants? Where they self-selecting? Did you have an inclusion and exclusion criteria?
- What was the background of the researcher- male, female, local to the area? Who conducted the FGD? And how many - note taker?
- Did you collect field notes? If so where these included in the data?

Analysis

- What analysis approach / what guided your analysis and procedure? see Yin R K. 2014 Case study research: Design and method. (5th Ed) Thousand Oaks. CA Sage. For example, did you do:
Holistic - entire case, who undertook the analysis?

Embedded - specific aspect of the case

Did you focus on specific issues to understand the complexity of the case? If so what were they?

Can you discuss how the social representation framework was used to guide your analysis the data? for example was it used to inform predefined codes/ coding framework? or your reflections about the case? Identify aspects of the case?

Results and discussion

Consider identifiers (age, location, pseudonym) for the quotes

Usually a vignette is used at the start of a case study to illustrate and provide the reader with an introduction to the feel of the context in which he case takes place.

Perhaps combine this section together as it would read more like a case study approach then:

- It is common to use a narrative description in case studies- tell a story : integrating the direct quotes with indirect - paraphrasing and drawing from your observations and the literature to make it more of a narrative description of the case and context.

- An issue description is common - drawing form the data sources with your interpretations

- Followed by the presentation of the overall case claims

- Reflective process: What was your reflective process - as this is very important for case study research? A sub heading about this and limitations strengths would be appropriate

A closing vignette provides the reader with a final experience. It is a way of bringing context in and reminding the reader that this is one group of peoples encounters of a complex case.

Finally, it would appear that perhaps what you have done is an intrinsic case study- in which the focus is on the case itself TBA - Skilled care? (e.g. evaluating a program)?

You need to remember that this focus is on the narrative- and offer a detailed description of the case, set within the context and surroundings.

If not - then perhaps call this a qualitative study and not a case study as the way it is presented supports, the former.
Tables

Please review the presentation of these. For example, age can be categorised into groups or a mean with a standard deviation. You also need to include how you analysed this and collected this data.

Remove the ID was this study funded? any conflicts of interest

good luck
this paper is worthy of publication after major revisions

**Are the methods appropriate and well described?**
If not, please specify what is required in your comments to the authors.

No

**Does the work include the necessary controls?**
If not, please specify which controls are required in your comments to the authors.

No

**Are the conclusions drawn adequately supported by the data shown?**
If not, please explain in your comments to the authors.

Yes

**Are you able to assess any statistics in the manuscript or would you recommend an additional statistical review?**
If an additional statistical review is recommended, please specify what aspects require further assessment in your comments to the editors.

Not relevant to this manuscript

**Quality of written English**
Please indicate the quality of language in the manuscript:
Declaring of competing interests

Please complete a declaration of competing interests, considering the following questions:

1. Have you in the past five years received reimbursements, fees, funding, or salary from an organisation that may in any way gain or lose financially from the publication of this manuscript, either now or in the future?

2. Do you hold any stocks or shares in an organisation that may in any way gain or lose financially from the publication of this manuscript, either now or in the future?

3. Do you hold or are you currently applying for any patents relating to the content of the manuscript?

4. Have you received reimbursements, fees, funding, or salary from an organization that holds or has applied for patents relating to the content of the manuscript?

5. Do you have any other financial competing interests?

6. Do you have any non-financial competing interests in relation to this paper?

If you can answer no to all of the above, write 'I declare that I have no competing interests' below. If your reply is yes to any, please give details below.

I declare that I have no competing interests

I agree to the open peer review policy of the journal. I understand that my name will be included on my report to the authors and, if the manuscript is accepted for publication, my named report including any attachments I upload will be posted on the website along with the authors' responses. I agree for my report to be made available under an Open Access Creative Commons CC-BY license (http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/). I understand that any comments which I do not wish to be included in my named report can be included as confidential comments to the editors, which will not be published.

I agree to the open peer review policy of the journal