Reviewer’s report

Title: Atypical frontal lobe seizure as the first manifestation of gall-bladder cancer: a case report.

Version: 1 Date: 29 Jan 2018

Reviewer: Monica Maria Francesca Puligheddu

Reviewer’s report:

In this manuscript the Au's, describe an atypical case of focal seizure as primary manifestation of Gall bladder cancer (GBC).

Introduction: there is a meagre examination of literature about GBC and its typical manifestations. According with word counting limit, it would be useful to better scrutinize the literature.

Case presentation: quite well described in clinical term, good analysis of the video although the lack of EEG ictal and/or interictal, is the major problem in this case description.

Brain MRI description: the interpretation of the described lesion is, to me, a bit incomplete and confused. It is not clear to me the term of focal atrophy. What exactly intend the Au's? If, as probably is, the primary explanation is an ischemic lesion, then the correct term would be, for example "post infarction malacia with residual gliosis" or similar. This, to better define the lack of tissue related to the vascular lesion.

In Fig 1 A and B is represented the T1 hypointense and T2 hyperintense lesion in left frontal area; a coronal projection could be useful to better define the morphology and dimension of the lesion. Since the nature of this lesion is not completely clear, as the Au's affirm, an evolutive (1 or three month ) control (if available) it would be useful.

Another useful possibility to discriminate between vascular or repetitive lesion, could be a H1 MRI spectroscopy if available.

Videos: a description of the state of awareness of the subject would be helpful. Again, the lack of EEG is the most critical observation of this case presentation.

In conclusion this case is quite well described, interesting the fact that focal seizure is the primary manifestation of GBC but specifically for that, the presence of ictal and or interictal EEG recordings added with ocular EOG derivation would improve the description.

Are the methods appropriate and well described?
If not, please specify what is required in your comments to the authors.

Yes
Does the work include the necessary controls?
If not, please specify which controls are required in your comments to the authors.

Yes

Are the conclusions drawn adequately supported by the data shown?
If not, please explain in your comments to the authors.

Yes

Are you able to assess any statistics in the manuscript or would you recommend an additional statistical review?
If an additional statistical review is recommended, please specify what aspects require further assessment in your comments to the editors.

Not relevant to this manuscript

Quality of written English
Please indicate the quality of language in the manuscript:

Acceptable

Declaration of competing interests
Please complete a declaration of competing interests, considering the following questions:

1. Have you in the past five years received reimbursements, fees, funding, or salary from an organisation that may in any way gain or lose financially from the publication of this manuscript, either now or in the future?

2. Do you hold any stocks or shares in an organisation that may in any way gain or lose financially from the publication of this manuscript, either now or in the future?

3. Do you hold or are you currently applying for any patents relating to the content of the manuscript?

4. Have you received reimbursements, fees, funding, or salary from an organization that holds or has applied for patents relating to the content of the manuscript?

5. Do you have any other financial competing interests?

6. Do you have any non-financial competing interests in relation to this paper?

If you can answer no to all of the above, write 'I declare that I have no competing interests' below. If your reply is yes to any, please give details below.

I declare that I have no competing interests
I agree to the open peer review policy of the journal. I understand that my name will be included on my report to the authors and, if the manuscript is accepted for publication, my named report including any attachments I upload will be posted on the website along with the authors' responses. I agree for my report to be made available under an Open Access Creative Commons CC-BY license (http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/). I understand that any comments which I do not wish to be included in my named report can be included as confidential comments to the editors, which will not be published.

I agree to the open peer review policy of the journal