Reviewer’s report

Title: A review of clinical trial designs used to detect a disease-modifying effect of drug therapy in Alzheimer's disease and Parkinson's disease

Version: 0 Date: 18 Dec 2015

Reviewer: Simon Lewis

Reviewer's report:

I think this is a really well written, helpful and timely contribution.

Minor points for the authors:

Why were trials testing intraventricular or intrathecal treatments, foetal or embryonic stem cells, striatal delivery of growth factors, or deep brain stimulation excluded? Patients always ask about these things!

Page 17 line 1. Do the authors want to keep their thoughts on delayed start more general across AD and PD rather than flagging the basal ganglia as a site of compensatory changes.

Page 19, line 49. The authors should probably acknowledge that the amount of a symptomatic treatment taken will also be highly variable between individual patients depending on the neurobiology, metabolism, body weight, resistance to taking medication (e.g. L-dopa phobia).

Typos:

Page 8, line 45: "...practically defined off phase..."

Page 15, line 35: "...irreversibly..."

Are the methods appropriate and well described?
If not, please specify what is required in your comments to the authors.

Yes

Does the work include the necessary controls?
If not, please specify which controls are required in your comments to the authors.

Unable to assess

Are the conclusions drawn adequately supported by the data shown?
If not, please explain in your comments to the authors.
Yes

Are you able to assess any statistics in the manuscript or would you recommend an additional statistical review?
If an additional statistical review is recommended, please specify what aspects require further assessment in your comments to the editors.

Not relevant to this manuscript

Quality of written English
Please indicate the quality of language in the manuscript:

Acceptable

Declaration of competing interests
Please complete a declaration of competing interests, considering the following questions:

1. Have you in the past five years received reimbursements, fees, funding, or salary from an organisation that may in any way gain or lose financially from the publication of this manuscript, either now or in the future?

2. Do you hold any stocks or shares in an organisation that may in any way gain or lose financially from the publication of this manuscript, either now or in the future?

3. Do you hold or are you currently applying for any patents relating to the content of the manuscript?

4. Have you received reimbursements, fees, funding, or salary from an organization that holds or has applied for patents relating to the content of the manuscript?

5. Do you have any other financial competing interests?

6. Do you have any non-financial competing interests in relation to this paper?

If you can answer no to all of the above, write 'I declare that I have no competing interests' below. If your reply is yes to any, please give details below.

I declare that I have no competing interests

I agree to the open peer review policy of the journal. I understand that my name will be included on my report to the authors and, if the manuscript is accepted for publication, my named report including any attachments I upload will be posted on the website along with the authors' responses. I agree for my report to be made available under an Open Access Creative Commons CC-BY license (http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/). I understand that any comments
which I do not wish to be included in my named report can be included as confidential comments to the editors, which will not be published.

I agree to the open peer review policy of the journal