Reviewer’s report

Title: Radiographic Occult Cerebellar Germinoma Presenting with Progressive Ataxia and Cranial Nerve Palsy Case Report

Version: 5 Date: 2 September 2015

Reviewer: Kazuya Motomura

Reviewer’s report:

This manuscript by Noriaki Minami et al reported a primary cerebellar germinoma case, which both T2*-weighted imaging (T2*WI) and susceptibility-weighted imaging (SWI) was useful as the reliable diagnosis. Furthermore, the authors emphasized the usefulness of SWI to detect basal ganglia germinoma, previously reported. Basal ganglia germinomas on SWI was characteristics of an obvious hypointensity not only in the tumor but also in the globus pallidus. As a reason, it was thought that tumor invasion to the basal ganglia may lead to disruption in axonal transport of transferrin, resulting in abnormal iron accumulation in the basal ganglia.

In the present case, however, I am not sure how a cerebellar germinoma is associated with abnormal iron accumulation.

In my opinion, low-intensity lesions on T2*WI and SWI for this case showed that this tumor merely include intratumoral blood. Thus, the feature on T2*WI and SWI never provide important information in the differential diagnosis of cerebellar tumor.

Therefore, unfortunately, I cannot recommend this manuscript for publication in BMC Neurology.

Level of interest: An article of limited interest

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.