Reviewer's report

Title: Radiographic Occult Cerebellar Germinoma Presenting with Progressive Ataxia and Cranial Nerve Palsy Case Report

Version: 5 Date: 21 March 2015

Reviewer: Ji Hoon Phi

Reviewer's report:

The authors report a rare case of cerebellar germinoma diagnosed in an adult patient. There are many interesting aspects in the case, that is, very unusual location, relatively old age of onset, and occult presentation of germinoma. Some of the characteristics are common in germinomas; however, it is quite unusual to find them all in the same patient. Therefore, this case report is interesting enough, but needs further revision.

Major compulsory revisions:

1. Does the patient have any abnormality in the FLAIR images at presentation? Please provide initial T2WI, FLAIR, and sagittal T1WI. (If they are truly normal, provide them in the supplementary figures)

2. It is not easy to make clinical decisions based on positive findings in only T2*WI and SWI without other accompanying evidence. Is there any other report on the use of the imaging sequences for diagnosis of germinoma?

3. Some occult germinoma exhibits hypermetabolism in methionine PET, as demonstrated in studies of basal ganglia germinoma. Did the patient have any PET studies? The authors should discuss the impact of this modality.

4. It would be better to include a table summarizing clinical characteristics of cerebellar or posterior fossa germ cell tumors reported in the literature.

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests