Reviewer’s report

Title: Multiple Intracranial Arteries Stenosis Influence the Long-term Prognosis of Symptomatic Middle Cerebral Artery Occlusion

Version: 2 Date: 17 February 2015

Reviewer: neal rao

Reviewer’s report:

The authors present a large case series comparing patients who have middle cerebral artery occlusion (MCAO) with patients who have a combination of MCAO and diffuse asymptomatic intracranial stenosis (AIS). This is an important topic given the high prevalence of intracranial atherosclerosis world wide and particularly in Asia.

- Major Compulsory Revisions

It is unfortunate that the poor sentence structure detracts from the science of the paper. I would highly recommend that a proficient English speaker edit the paper, with particular attention to the abstract.

In the group of patients with isolated M1 occlusion, there may be a high incidence of paroxysmal atrial fibrillation as the etiology of the infarction. As the goal of the study is to contrast two types of atherosclerotic occlusive disease, an imbalance in the incidence of paroxysmal atrial fibrillation in one group may color the analysis. Please expand on how paroxysmal atrial fibrillation was evaluated, as it is an important exclusion criterion for this study.

Please expand on the follow-up section in “methods.” How often was a follow up interview performed? Were the interviewers blinded to the patient’s clinical history or group allocation? How was the interview standardized? As responses to telephone interviews may be highly subjective, potential sources of bias should be addressed.

- Minor Essential Revisions:

I would like to suggest renaming the category “MCAO concomitant intracranial arteries disease” to “MCAO with concomitant intracranial arterial disease (MCAO-AIS)” and uniformly using MCAO-AIS subsequently throughout the paper to avoid confusion.

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Not suitable for publication unless extensively edited

Statistical review: Yes, but I do not feel adequately qualified to assess the
statistics.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests.