Reviewer's report

Title: Recurrent Posterior Circulation Strokes Caused by the Anomalous Occipital Bony Process in a Young Patient

Version: 2  Date: 8 September 2014

Reviewer: Andrew Carlson

Reviewer's report:

BMC review of
'Recurrent Posterior Circulation Strokes Caused by the Anomalous Occipital Bony Process in a Young Patient'

The article presents a case report of a young patient with recurrent posterior fossa strokes which was eventually thought to be related to positional kinking and thrombus formation in the extracranial vertebral artery related to a bony anomaly of the occipital bone. I think this represents an interesting case which was successfully treated with occlusion of the vessel. The primary strength is in underlying the need for a thorough review of causation in a young patient with stroke, particularly early. As the authors correctly point out, positional kinking of the vertebral artery is not a new concept, and we routinely perform dynamic angiography for these suspected “bowhunter syndrome” patients. My comments are all minor essential, and I think the article deserves publication.

- Please review the English in the manuscript. There are several awkward sentences and grammatical errors (e.g. page 2, the very last word begins the sentence with “And”)

- The dynamic MRI is interesting, but I think the difference noted with turning to the right is subtle. Was there a dynamic angiogram performed? Was consideration given to this?

- I would think that a very brief review of stroke in young patients from positional kinking would be in order in the discussion. I think the authors should put the report into the context of needing to identify a cause of recurrent stroke in a young patient in the discussion rather than mostly a discussion of the case decision making.

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:
I declare that I have no competing interests