Author’s response to reviews

Title: Evaluating the effect of garlic extract on serum inflammatory markers of peritoneal dialysis patients: A randomized double-blind clinical trial study

Authors:

Elham Zare (elhamzr59@gmail.com)
Amirhesam Alirezaie (amirhesamalirezaie1396@gmail.com)
Mahmood Bakhtiyari (mahmood.bakhtiyari@ymail.com)
Asieh Mansouri (asmans_isf2000@yahoo.com)

Version: 2 Date: 25 Oct 2018

Author’s response to reviews:

Editor Comments:

Sample size calculation

In the methods section, please describe how sample size was determined. If a sample size calculation was not performed please explain why it was not possible or was not appropriate

Response: Amended and highlighted in the method section.

Reviewer reports:

Nadereh Rashtchizadeh (Reviewer 1):

The manuscript entitled "Evaluating the effect of garlic extract on serum inflammatory markers of peritoneal dialysis patients: A randomized double-blind clinical trial study" (BNEP-D-18-00389R1) reported that administrating 400 mg of standardized garlic extract twice a day for 8 weeks resulted in a significant reduction in IL-6, CRP and ESR., They suggest prescribing this safe and well-tolerated natural substance to attenuate the inflammatory state in those patients.

This article is very interesting.

It may become one of the methods to control inflammation of the peritoneal dialysis.

When you add 3 points, I think that it becomes better.
1- Some data in this article seem to be irrelevant with the subject matter. For example, what is the purpose of measuring factors such as SGOT, SGPT, or Uric Acid, …? If a specific goal is pursued, it is necessary to discuss these issues in the discussion section and otherwise it is better to delete them.

- Answer: As we mentioned in Method section, inflammatory markers were our primary outcomes. Other factors were considered as our secondary outcomes. We hinted to this in discussion section. The changes are green highlighted.

2- Please add p values data in result section of abstract

- Answer: In line to your admirable comment, we added p values data in result section of abstract and yellow highlighted them.

3- Please indicate the type or breed of garlic consumed in this study

- Answer: We had mentioned it in method section: “tablets containing 1 mg (1000 mcg) of Alliin”. We highlighted it with pink color in text.

Renzo Bonofiglio (Reviewer 2):

The work by Zare et al. investigate the effectiveness of garlic extract in lowering inflammatory markers in peritoneal dialysis (PD) patients. The work could warrant publication in 'BMC Nephrology' if the following concerns are addressed.

Concerns:

- Define the meaning of all acronyms used in the main text.

- Answer: Thank You for mentioning this important point. We defined all in first time and turquoise highlighted them for your consideration.
- In the section Biochemical assay, why the authors talk about serum aliquots? They state that the samples were collected into standard plain and EDTA vacutainer tubes; so they should talk about plasma aliquots.

- Answer: The Biochemical assay section is now revised totally.

- The materials section concerning the blood samples used for the various assays performed should be more detailed. Is it possible that for all the biochemical parameters determined the venous blood samples were collected only in EDTA vacutainer tubes?

Answer: Done

- The authors described that garlic extract exerts its beneficial effects in PD patients attenuating the inflammatory state. At the same time, in this the current study witnessed no significant effect of garlic on lipid profile markers. As the increase of lipid profile represents a traditional and critical risk factor of CVD in patients with chronic kidney disease, the authors should discuss better about their opposite outcome.

- Answer: Thanks a lot for your worthy comment. We added more details in discussion and highlighted them with red color for your consideration.

- Please characterize the inflammatory state using more markers (IL-1, TNF-α…) in ELISA assay.

- Answer: measuring other inflammatory markers were not in hand because of their cost and besides they were not readily available here in Iran due to sanctions.