Reviewer's report

Title: IgA nephropathy featuring massive wire loop-like deposits in two patients with alcoholic cirrhosis; Case Report

Version: 0 Date: 07 Sep 2016

Reviewer: Andrew Allegretti

Reviewer's report:
Overall this is a well-written and nice description of 2 cases of IgAN in alcoholic cirrhosis. My reservations about the conclusions of this report is below:

Major comments
- I think the connection between portosystemic shunting and IgA nephropathy is overstated. IgA nephropathy is common in Asian populations, as are development of collaterals (paraumbilical veins, esophageal varices, etc) in patients with cirrhosis and portal hypertension. It is not clear that these would be connected pathophysiologically.
- I think it is more likely that IgA nephropathy was incidentally discovered in 2 Japanese men with cirrhosis due to alcoholism.
- I am not aware of the difference between "primary IgA" and "atypical" or "secondary" IgA nephropathy histologically, perhaps the authors could explain this a bit more. The more traditional systemic IgA vasculitis (or HSP) has similar renal pathology findings as renal-limited IgAN.
- Figures of pathology are beautiful and nicely described in prose
- Discussion section does not make a clear connection between IgAN and alcoholic cirrhosis. Much of the section presents the case that alcohol intake is inversely related to IgA severity.

Minor comments
- sentence fragment page 4 , line 2-3
- not clear why second biopsies were clinically indicated in these patients who were in clinical remission from their disease
Are the methods appropriate and well described?
If not, please specify what is required in your comments to the authors.
Yes

Does the work include the necessary controls?
If not, please specify which controls are required in your comments to the authors.
Unable to assess

Are the conclusions drawn adequately supported by the data shown?
If not, please explain in your comments to the authors.
No

Are you able to assess any statistics in the manuscript or would you recommend an additional statistical review?
If an additional statistical review is recommended, please specify what aspects require further assessment in your comments to the editors.
Not relevant to this manuscript

Quality of written English
Please indicate the quality of language in the manuscript:
Acceptable

Declaration of competing interests
Please complete a declaration of competing interests, considering the following questions:

1. Have you in the past five years received reimbursements, fees, funding, or salary from an organisation that may in any way gain or lose financially from the publication of this manuscript, either now or in the future?
2. Do you hold any stocks or shares in an organisation that may in any way gain or lose financially from the publication of this manuscript, either now or in the future?
3. Do you hold or are you currently applying for any patents relating to the content of the manuscript?
4. Have you received reimbursements, fees, funding, or salary from an organization that holds or has applied for patents relating to the content of the manuscript?
5. Do you have any other financial competing interests?
6. Do you have any non-financial competing interests in relation to this paper?
If you can answer no to all of the above, write 'I declare that I have no competing interests' below. If your reply is yes to any, please give details below.

I declare I have no competing interests

I agree to the open peer review policy of the journal. I understand that my name will be included on my report to the authors and, if the manuscript is accepted for publication, my named report including any attachments I upload will be posted on the website along with the authors' responses. I agree for my report to be made available under an Open Access Creative Commons CC-BY license (http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/). I understand that any comments which I do not wish to be included in my named report can be included as confidential comments to the editors, which will not be published.

I agree to the open peer review policy of the journal