Reviewer’s report

Title: An integrative review of the methodology and findings regarding dietary adherence in end stage kidney disease

Version: 0 Date: 09 Aug 2017

Reviewer: Claudia D'Alessandro

Reviewer's report:

This paper aimed to review the methods used to measure dietary adherence and the rate of dietary adherence in end stage renal diseases (ESRD). Factors associated with dietary adherence were also described.

The authors included 60 papers and 24743 patients most of whom were on dialysis.

The most common method of measuring dietary adherence in ESRD was subjective techniques (food diaries or adherence questionnaires). Adherence to nutrients intake was highly variable due to differences in measurement methods used and were often derived from a limited evidence base. Socioeconomic status, age, social support and self-efficacy were associated with dietary adherence.

General comments

The topic is interesting as it is well known that adherence to renal diets is difficult to obtain as they are characterized by many recommendations.

Methods are appropriated, the analysis seems to be well conducted.

The current nutritional treatment of CKD is characterized by a stepwise approach tailored on the patient's clinical needs and preferences: probably this is the reason why dietary adherence in CKD is frequently estimated by subjective self-reported information. I know that the authors selected papers until 2005 but there are many papers published in the last two years that report different experiences of patient-based nutritional approach. These experiences could help to understand how to measure adherence and to find the barriers to a better compliance. I would appreciate the authors take into consideration also these papers.
Minor

I would appreciate if the authors provided more details on why the papers excluded were non suitable for the analysis, these information may also be useful for future research.

It is preferable to talk about "renal diets" rather than "renal diet" as the dietary treatment in CKD and ESRD does not include a single type of diet.

It would be interesting to underline the differences between adherence to the nutritional therapy in CKD not on dialysis and nutritional therapy ESRD

Studies included in this review involved an extremely variable number of patients, in fact the author stated that " ...sample sizes in the studies varied from 4 people to more than 7000...". Why do the authors include studies with such a small sample size?

Please check the list of the references if the number of the volume and the pages are present in all

Are the methods appropriate and well described?
If not, please specify what is required in your comments to the authors.
Yes

Does the work include the necessary controls?
If not, please specify which controls are required in your comments to the authors.
Unable to assess

Are the conclusions drawn adequately supported by the data shown?
If not, please explain in your comments to the authors.
Yes

Are you able to assess any statistics in the manuscript or would you recommend an additional statistical review?
If an additional statistical review is recommended, please specify what aspects require further assessment in your comments to the editors.
Not relevant to this manuscript
Quality of written English
Please indicate the quality of language in the manuscript:

Acceptable

Declaration of competing interests
Please complete a declaration of competing interests, considering the following questions:

1. Have you in the past five years received reimbursements, fees, funding, or salary from an organisation that may in any way gain or lose financially from the publication of this manuscript, either now or in the future?

2. Do you hold any stocks or shares in an organisation that may in any way gain or lose financially from the publication of this manuscript, either now or in the future?

3. Do you hold or are you currently applying for any patents relating to the content of the manuscript?

4. Have you received reimbursements, fees, funding, or salary from an organisation that holds or has applied for patents relating to the content of the manuscript?

5. Do you have any other financial competing interests?

6. Do you have any non-financial competing interests in relation to this paper?

If you can answer no to all of the above, write 'I declare that I have no competing interests' below. If your reply is yes to any, please give details below.

I declare that I have no competing interests

I agree to the open peer review policy of the journal. I understand that my name will be included on my report to the authors and, if the manuscript is accepted for publication, my named report including any attachments I upload will be posted on the website along with the authors' responses. I agree for my report to be made available under an Open Access Creative Commons CC-BY license (http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/). I understand that any comments which I do not wish to be included in my named report can be included as confidential comments to the editors, which will not be published.

I agree to the open peer review policy of the journal