Reviewer's report

Title: Kidney Function and Comorbid Disorders in Patients with Kidney Stone Disease

Version: 2 Date: 27 April 2015

Reviewer: Naeem Bhojani

Reviewer's report:

Sigurjonsdottir et al. report interesting results regarding the impact of kidney stone disease on renal function. Others have published similar findings but the elimination of confounding comorbidities enhances the importance of this manuscript.

Title: inappropriate title. Something clearer would be better. For example: "Impact of renal stone disease on kidney function"

Abstract: appropriate

Introduction: appropriate

Methods: overall this section is adequate but one clarification is needed:
A clinical stone event was defined as acute flank pain associated with hematuria and/OR the detection of a stone by imaging. Does that mean that flank pain and hematuria alone were considered as an acute stone event (without imaging)? Please clarify. If this is the case than an obstructing tumor or pyelonephritis woud have been considered as a stone event?

Results: overall adequate however I don’t think radiolucent stones can be considered uric acid. Many times stones not seen on x-ray are just hidden by bowel gas. Uric acid stone should only be considered uric acid unless they are confirmed on stone analysis.

Discussion: Limitations of the study need to expanded to include the above mentioned critics.

Conclusion: adequate

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: Yes, but I do not feel adequately qualified to assess the statistics.

Declaration of competing interests:
I declare that I have no competing interests.