Reviewer's report

Title: Probing Protein Energy Wasting in Haemodialysis Patients Using Appetite Assessment: A Cross-Sectional Study in the Malaysian Dialysis Setting

Version: 1 Date: 23 February 2015

Reviewer: Jeroen P Kooman

Reviewer's report:

In this cross sectional study, the authors investigated the relation between appetite scores with different nutritional and inflammatory parameters as well as criteria for protein energy malnutrition.

Major revisions
1. My main concern reflects the interpretation of the data. The authors mention repeatedly that appetite does not reflect or correlate with PEW criteria. However, the prevalence of PEW is greatly different among the appetite rating categories (very good: 17.6%, poor: 83.3%). Also a strong relation between appetite and other nutritional markers was observed. From these data, it could be well argued that appetite is quite well related to different parameters of malnutrition. Could the authors please explain their argumentation in more detail?

2. The aims of the study needs some clarification. What was the hypothesis?

3. Cut off levels for Lean Tissue Mass: why as a LTM below 29.6 kg chosen as cut-off, instead of the sex and age specific cut-off limits proposed by the manufacturer of the BCM?

Minor revisions:
1. Please check references (e.g. ref 41 is incorrect).

2. The wording sometimes suggests a prospective study (e.g. abstract LTM "declined", "appetite worsened"), whereas the study is cross sectional

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Statistical review: Yes, and I have assessed the statistics in my report.

Declaration of competing interests:
'I declare that I have no competing interests'