Reviewer’s report

Title: Kidney Injury Molecule-1 Expression in Human Kidney Transplants With Interstitial Fibrosis and Tubular Atrophy

Version: 2

Date: 16 November 2014

Reviewer: Andrea Kramer

Reviewer’s report:

Nogare et al describe in this paper the molecular an protein expressions of KIM-1 in dysfunctional allografts, in combination with urinary KIM-1 expression as potential biomarkers of graft fibrosis. The study is well described study, with interesting results.

Major Compulsory Revisions

When looking for the previous reports of this group on KIM-1 in renal transplant recipients this report seems to be on the same patient data as previous publications in Transplant proceedings in 2010 and 2012 (especially the 2012 report). In the 2012 report even more biopsies were available for analysis (49 acute rejection, and now 43; 10 CIN and now 9, 29 IF/TA and now 20). In the 2012 paper authors indicate it were for indication graft biopsies between January 2008 and December 2009.

It is not clear why the 6 AR, 1 CIN and 9 IF/TA patients are not analyzed now, where they outliers? Even there is no statement on selection criteria of the biopsies, where it all consecutive patients?

In the 2010 paper already the tissue KIM-1 mRNA data were given for 59 patients (probably another group of patients). However, it seems that techniques were available at the time of the 2012 paper. Still the data are interesting, but I would like to see the references to the earlier 2012 paper in this article and at least a statement that these group of patients was earlier studied..

In the last alinea of the discussion the authors explore the function of KIM-1 graft fibrosis, this paper explores the role of KIM-1 in IF/TA. However in the final sentence the authors make a note that serum KIM-1 is predictive of the development of later acute rejection. This is indeed interesting, and shown by more authors, I would however suggest to make this point at another place in the discussion and not at the end of the discussion, this weakens your message.

Minor essential revisions

Spelling mistake
- sentence 102: bellow change in below

Level of interest: An article of limited interest
Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests