Reviewer's report

Title: Genetic polymorphisms at SIRT1 and FOXO1 are associated with carotid atherosclerosis in the SAPHIR cohort

Version: 1 Date: 2 August 2014

Reviewer: Christoph Saely

Reviewer's report:

This is a very well written manuscript from a working group that is well established in the field and uses an important central European cohort study. The presented data are novel and important and should be of interest to the readers of BMC Medical Genetics.

The question posed by the authors is clearly defined; methods are adequate and appropriately described, data and data analyses are sound, and the manuscript adheres to standards for reporting and data deposition. Discussion and conclusions are well balanced and adequately supported by the data. The authors clearly acknowledge work upon which they are building (Stroke 2005, 36(6):1212-1217.8). The title and abstract accurately convey what has been found.

The only significant limitation, which is also acknowledged by the authors, is the lack of a validation cohort. If statistical power is sufficient, the authors may consider to perform their main analyses separately on two random subsets of their study cohort (without using adjustment for multiple comparisons) to see whether their results are confirmed using this internal validation approach.

Major compulsory revisions

None.

Minor Essential Revisions

None.

Discretionary Revisions

If statistical power is sufficient, the authors may consider to perform their main analyses separately on two random subsets of their study cohort (without using adjustment for multiple comparisons) to see whether their results are confirmed using this internal validation approach.

Level of interest: An article of outstanding merit and interest in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable
**Statistical review:** Yes, and I have assessed the statistics in my report.

**Declaration of competing interests:**

I declare that I have no competing interests.