Reviewer’s report


Version: 0 Date: 05 Sep 2019

Reviewer: Kyung Won Kim

Reviewer's report:

This is a kind of case series of 14 patients with Abernethy malformation, mainly focusing on CT findings. In clinical practice, the diagnosis of this very rare disease entity largely relies on CT findings, even though interventional angiography is regarded as gold standard.

Regarding the originality, this paper aimed to demonstrate manifestations of CT and its diagnostic accuracy for diagnosis of the Abernethy malformation when comparing to the interventional angiography. However, the Abernethy malformation is a well-known anomaly and there have been several preexisting papers for the anatomic information and CT findings.

As to the methodology, this paper has simple and straightforward method. It provided clinical information, CT findings, DSA findings, and treatment. However, there is no information of treatment outcome. If authors provide the treatment outcome, the value of this paper will be much increased. In addition, the diagnostic accuracy was 85.7% (12/14), and the reason of misdiagnosis on CT was failure to visualize the extremely hypoplastic portal veins distal to the shunt with CT angiography. However, due to small sample size, it might be difficult to confirm this diagnostic accuracy.

The style and grammar of this paper should be checked throughout the manuscript.

Are the methods appropriate and well described?
If not, please specify what is required in your comments to the authors.

No

Does the work include the necessary controls?
If not, please specify which controls are required in your comments to the authors.

No

Are the conclusions drawn adequately supported by the data shown?
If not, please explain in your comments to the authors.

No
Are you able to assess any statistics in the manuscript or would you recommend an additional statistical review?
If an additional statistical review is recommended, please specify what aspects require further assessment in your comments to the editors.

I am able to assess the statistics

Quality of written English
Please indicate the quality of language in the manuscript:

Needs some language corrections before being published

Declaration of competing interests
Please complete a declaration of competing interests, considering the following questions:

1. Have you in the past five years received reimbursements, fees, funding, or salary from an organisation that may in any way gain or lose financially from the publication of this manuscript, either now or in the future?

2. Do you hold any stocks or shares in an organisation that may in any way gain or lose financially from the publication of this manuscript, either now or in the future?

3. Do you hold or are you currently applying for any patents relating to the content of the manuscript?

4. Have you received reimbursements, fees, funding, or salary from an organisation that holds or has applied for patents relating to the content of the manuscript?

5. Do you have any other financial competing interests?

6. Do you have any non-financial competing interests in relation to this paper?

If you can answer no to all of the above, write 'I declare that I have no competing interests' below. If your reply is yes to any, please give details below.

I declare that I have no competing interests.

I agree to the open peer review policy of the journal. I understand that my name will be included on my report to the authors and, if the manuscript is accepted for publication, my named report including any attachments I upload will be posted on the website along with the authors' responses. I agree for my report to be made available under an Open Access Creative Commons CC-BY license (http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/). I understand that any comments which I do not wish to be included in my named report can be included as confidential comments to the editors, which will not be published.

I agree to the open peer review policy of the journal