Reviewer’s report

Title: Rapid Development of HIV Elite Control in a Patient with Acute Infection

Version: 1 Date: 09 Jul 2019

Reviewer: Venkata Satish Bollimpelli

Reviewer's report:

The article entitled "Rapid development of HIV elite control in a patient with acute infection" by Deirdre Morley et al presented a case of a patient with HIV acute infection who controlled her viremia without ART. They have tracked longitudinal immune response and viral kinetics during the infection and following ART initiation after 2 years of infection. This article provided useful information and would be more informative if the following comments are addressed.

Comments:
1. The source of infection in the patient is not clear as it was mentioned in manuscript that her partner was not known to be high risk.
2. The authors mentioned that patient was given ART due to multifocal furnculosis despite continued suppression of virus and stable CD-4 T cell counts. Didn't she receive antibiotic treatment for furnculosis. More clear reasoning is needed why ART was initiated in the patient.
3. Replication competence of the infected virus need to be analyzed.
4. Serum antibody levels and data on neutralization capacity of those antibodies during the course of infection will enhance the scope of the article.
5. In Discussion line 156, it was stated that there is an increase in both cellular and humoral HIV specific responses following ART. However, as far as I can see, there is no humoral data following ART. Please explain this.
6. In Discussion line 157, the authors hypothesized increased immune response following ART might be a more generalized immune process that blunted earlier HIV specific responses. Please quote some references if similar observations or related observations were made earlier.
7. In Discussion line 168, the authors mentioned "despite delayed increase in HIV specific CD8-T cell responses". However, the manuscript doesn't present any longitudinal CD8- T cell response before ART initiation that could substantiate authors statements. Please explain this.
8. More discussion is needed on how immune responses increased following ART initiation despite no plasma viremia.

Are the methods appropriate and well described?
If not, please specify what is required in your comments to the authors.

Yes
Does the work include the necessary controls?
If not, please specify which controls are required in your comments to the authors.

Yes

Are the conclusions drawn adequately supported by the data shown?
If not, please explain in your comments to the authors.

No

Are you able to assess any statistics in the manuscript or would you recommend an additional statistical review?
If an additional statistical review is recommended, please specify what aspects require further assessment in your comments to the editors.

Not relevant to this manuscript

Quality of written English
Please indicate the quality of language in the manuscript:

Acceptable

Declaration of competing interests
Please complete a declaration of competing interests, considering the following questions:

1. Have you in the past five years received reimbursements, fees, funding, or salary from an organisation that may in any way gain or lose financially from the publication of this manuscript, either now or in the future?

2. Do you hold any stocks or shares in an organisation that may in any way gain or lose financially from the publication of this manuscript, either now or in the future?

3. Do you hold or are you currently applying for any patents relating to the content of the manuscript?

4. Have you received reimbursements, fees, funding, or salary from an organisation that holds or has applied for patents relating to the content of the manuscript?

5. Do you have any other financial competing interests?

6. Do you have any non-financial competing interests in relation to this paper?

If you can answer no to all of the above, write 'I declare that I have no competing interests' below. If your reply is yes to any, please give details below.
I declare that I have no competing interests

I agree to the open peer review policy of the journal. I understand that my name will be included on my report to the authors and, if the manuscript is accepted for publication, my named report including any attachments I upload will be posted on the website along with the authors' responses. I agree for my report to be made available under an Open Access Creative Commons CC-BY license (http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/). I understand that any comments which I do not wish to be included in my named report can be included as confidential comments to the editors, which will not be published.

I agree to the open peer review policy of the journal