Author’s response to reviews

Title: Treatment outcomes and risk factors of extra-pulmonary tuberculosis in patients with comorbidities

Authors:

Amer Hayat Khan (dramer2006@gmail.com)
Syed Azhar Syed Sulaiman (sazhar@usm.my)
Madeeha Laghari (madeehalaghari@gmail.com)
Mohamed Azmi Ahmad Hassali (azmihassali@usm.my)
Abdul Razak Muttalif (drarm28@yahoo.com)
Zohra Bhatti (zohrabhatti@gmail.com)
Long Chiau Ming (long@puncakalam.uitm.edu.my)
Bandeh Ali Talpur (bandehali@gmail.com)

Version: 3 Date: 28 Jun 2019

Author’s response to reviews:

Dear Editor,

BMC Infectious Diseases,
(ref number NFD-D-18-01365R2)

Respected Sir,

We thank the reviewers for their valuable and substantial comments on above manuscript. We have carefully addressed their concerns and made corresponding revisions according to their advice. We also hope that after this revision our manuscript may be accepted for publication in BMC Infectious Diseases.

Reviewer reports:

Reviewer 2 (Reviewer 2):

Reviewer comments:
The authors provide a comprehensive description and analysis of the group of extra-pulmonary tuberculosis patients and predictors for the success of their treatment. However, the first paragraph in the Results section (Proportion, socio-demographic and baseline clinical characteristics) lacks an
objective control group, which results in misleading interpretations. As an example, the authors conclude that "Malays seemed to be highly affected with a number of 389 (31.8%) cases...". However, if the proportion of Malays in the general population in the study area is for example 50%, then Malays are in fact less affected than other population groups. The same applies to statements about urban/rural residents, age, and gender. The authors should include the basic socio-demographic data for a comparator group (preferably the general population in the study area) and use this to test statistical significance. Alternatively, the authors should abstain from making conclusions about the socio-demographic characteristics in the first paragraph of the Results section.

Reply: We agree with the point raised by reviewer; However, it is quite difficult to obtain general population data for the year 2006 to 2008. Therefore, following the previous published studies, we gave the proportion of socio-demographic and clinical characteristics based on total registered cases.

Tables 1 and 2 lack columns with Totals, which makes validation of the results cumbersome. This should also be addressed.

Reply: Corrections are done as per suggestions in Table 2, 3 and 4. However, for Table 1 the total numbers are previously mentioned.

The rest of the manuscript is interesting and of high quality, and with the above minor corrections the manuscript would be suitable for publication.

Reply: The authors are thankful to reviewer for such encouraging comments.

Sincerely,
Corresponding author

Amer Hayat Khan,
Department of Clinical Pharmacy,
School of Pharmaceutical Sciences,
Universiti Sains Malaysia, 11800 Penang, Malaysia
Email: dramer2006@gmail.com.