Reviewer’s report

Title: Case Report: Mechanisms of HIV Elite Control in two African Women

Version: 1 Date: 29 Sep 2017

Reviewer: Yi-Qun Kuang

Reviewer's report:

Moosa and colleagues describe the mechanism of HIV elite control in two Africa women. The work is interesting and basically full. However, some major points are needed to be addressed before it is acceptable for publication in BMC Infectious Diseases.

1. The infection history of the patients should be described in detail in the case presentation. How the patients were identified and the pre-infection sample collected and measured? Both are unclear.

2. The others host factors associated with HIV infection and AIDS progression should be tested, such as the A3G. The copy number of CCL3, CCR5 ligand, is of great importance in the disease progress.

3. The neutralizing antibodies activity in the serum of the patients remain unknown…patients with long-term infection are prone to produce anti-HIV antibodies.

4. The authors should extend the discussion of the pre-infection CD4 T cell response found in the EC2.

5. The authors declare that the importance of study of elite controller in high-incidence settings, please explain the association between settings and elite control.

6. Some typos should be corrected…see lines 183, 309
Are the methods appropriate and well described?
If not, please specify what is required in your comments to the authors.

Yes

Does the work include the necessary controls?
If not, please specify which controls are required in your comments to the authors.

Yes

Are the conclusions drawn adequately supported by the data shown?
If not, please explain in your comments to the authors.

No

Are you able to assess any statistics in the manuscript or would you recommend an additional statistical review?
If an additional statistical review is recommended, please specify what aspects require further assessment in your comments to the editors.

I am able to assess the statistics

Quality of written English
Please indicate the quality of language in the manuscript:

Needs some language corrections before being published

Declaration of competing interests
Please complete a declaration of competing interests, considering the following questions:

1. Have you in the past five years received reimbursements, fees, funding, or salary from an organisation that may in any way gain or lose financially from the publication of this manuscript, either now or in the future?

2. Do you hold any stocks or shares in an organisation that may in any way gain or lose financially from the publication of this manuscript, either now or in the future?

3. Do you hold or are you currently applying for any patents relating to the content of the manuscript?

4. Have you received reimbursements, fees, funding, or salary from an organization that holds or has applied for patents relating to the content of the manuscript?

5. Do you have any other financial competing interests?

6. Do you have any non-financial competing interests in relation to this paper?
If you can answer no to all of the above, write 'I declare that I have no competing interests' below. If your reply is yes to any, please give details below.

No.

I agree to the open peer review policy of the journal. I understand that my name will be included on my report to the authors and, if the manuscript is accepted for publication, my named report including any attachments I upload will be posted on the website along with the authors' responses. I agree for my report to be made available under an Open Access Creative Commons CC-BY license (http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/). I understand that any comments which I do not wish to be included in my named report can be included as confidential comments to the editors, which will not be published.

I agree to the open peer review policy of the journal