Reviewer’s report

Title: Overweight or obese BMI is associated with earlier, but not later survival after common acute illnesses

Version: 1 Date: 22 Nov 2017

Reviewer: Kirsty Bowman

Reviewer’s report:

Thank you for addressing all the comments I made.

Abstract

Please add the in the following sentence

"Using cox proportional hazards model, we examined the association between overweight or obese BMI (≥25.0 kg/m²) and mortality to 5 years after hospital admission, adjusted for potential confounders measured at the same time as BMI, including age, race, sex, education, partnership status, income, wealth, and smoking status.

Results

The paper could be strengthened by a mention of the mortality rates for the BMI Underweight group as this group is within Table 1.

Discussion

The paper could be strengthened further with a mention of the limitations of BMI (and whether any other measures of adiposity or body composition was/was not available for this study) within the limitations section. BMI does not capture body compositional changes with ageing i.e. fat redistribution, sarcopenia, and an increase in fat mass, and is also considered one of factors contributing to paradoxical results.

Conclusion

Please change is to with

"In older Americans, overweight or obese BMI was associated with improved survival to 1 year following hospitalization for congestive heart failure, pneumonia, and acute myocardial infarction."
Are the methods appropriate and well described?
If not, please specify what is required in your comments to the authors.

Yes

Does the work include the necessary controls?
If not, please specify which controls are required in your comments to the authors.

Yes

Are the conclusions drawn adequately supported by the data shown?
If not, please explain in your comments to the authors.

Yes

Are you able to assess any statistics in the manuscript or would you recommend an additional statistical review?
If an additional statistical review is recommended, please specify what aspects require further assessment in your comments to the editors.

I am able to assess the statistics

Quality of written English
Please indicate the quality of language in the manuscript:

Acceptable

Declaration of competing interests
Please complete a declaration of competing interests, considering the following questions:

1. Have you in the past five years received reimbursements, fees, funding, or salary from an organisation that may in any way gain or lose financially from the publication of this manuscript, either now or in the future?

2. Do you hold any stocks or shares in an organisation that may in any way gain or lose financially from the publication of this manuscript, either now or in the future?

3. Do you hold or are you currently applying for any patents relating to the content of the manuscript?

4. Have you received reimbursements, fees, funding, or salary from an organization that holds or has applied for patents relating to the content of the manuscript?

5. Do you have any other financial competing interests?

6. Do you have any non-financial competing interests in relation to this paper?
If you can answer no to all of the above, write 'I declare that I have no competing interests' below. If your reply is yes to any, please give details below.

I declare that I have no competing interests

I agree to the open peer review policy of the journal. I understand that my name will be included on my report to the authors and, if the manuscript is accepted for publication, my named report including any attachments I upload will be posted on the website along with the authors' responses. I agree for my report to be made available under an Open Access Creative Commons CC-BY license (http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/). I understand that any comments which I do not wish to be included in my named report can be included as confidential comments to the editors, which will not be published.

I agree to the open peer review policy of the journal