Reviewer's report

Title: Relationship between the Montreal Cognitive Assessment and Mini-Mental State Examination for Assessment of Mild Cognitive Impairment in Older Adults

Version: 3 Date: 24 March 2015

Reviewer: Aleksandar Videnovic

Reviewer's report:

Major Revisions

Trzepacz and colleagues explored the relationship between the MoCA and MMSE across the spectrum of individuals with normal cognition, MCI and dementia. They proposed a cutoff on the MoCA, which in combination with the Functional Activities Questionnaire and Trail Making test facilitates a better distinction between various categories of cognitive impairment. This is an important area of investigation. Some concerns mainly related to the methodology raise concerns related to the results interpretation. These are:

1. MCI subjects had a memory complaint, making results relevant only to the amnestic MCI subtype. What about non-amnestic MCI?
2. The "learning effect" related to the study instruments may have significantly influenced the results, as the scores from the follow up visits and not the baseline assessments were used. Further, the same subject studied under a different ADNI protocol were considered a different case.
3. The choice of the FAQ and Trail Making test is unclear, as it may not be the most relevant to the amnestic MCI population studied. Further, four selected cognitive domains used to differentiate MCI from controls do not capture the memory domain.

Minor revisions

4. Overall, the text should be shortened.

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: Yes, but I do not feel adequately qualified to assess the statistics.

Declaration of competing interests:

I have no competing interests.