Reviewer’s report

Title: Superior Mesenteric Artery Syndrome coexists with Nutcracker Syndrome in a female: a case report

Version: 1 Date: 15 Oct 2018

Reviewer: Silvio Mazziotti

Reviewer's report:

Although already described in literature, SMA and Nutcracker phenomenon are rare pathological conditions that sometimes can coexist. Radiologists and clinicians should always be aware of these conditions in young patients with an history of weight loss and abdominal pain.

The case is interesting and well written.

However, some points need to be clarified:

- In literature the SMA syndrome is also known as "Wilkie's syndrome". I suggest to add this denomination too.

- The authors refer to "Nutcracker phenomenon" and not to "Nutcracker syndrome". Indeed, it is true that the patients did not suffer from hematuria, but anyway a left flank pain was detected at the abdominal examination.

Moreover, two different phenotypes of Nutcracker phenomenon/syndrome exist (anterior and posterior).

I would like that the authors could be clearer in the text about these two points.

- The authors report that the upper gastrointestinal double-contrast radiograph was performed after the CT-scan. Considering the age and the gender of the patient, was it really necessary to achieve a diagnosis? If yes, was that the right timing for its performance (after the CT-scan)?

In this sense, I would like that the authors could briefly describe in discussion the different imaging modalities available (especially for the "radiation-free" alternatives), the indications and the principle findings for each one.

Moreover, I would suggest these articles:


- In my opinion, the graphical overlay pointers of Fig. 1 c are a bit confusing. I think they should be put within the structure that they are labeling. Maybe a "zoomed" detail of the image could be easily understandable for the reader.

Are the methods appropriate and well described?
If not, please specify what is required in your comments to the authors.

Yes

Does the work include the necessary controls?
If not, please specify which controls are required in your comments to the authors.

Unable to assess

Are the conclusions drawn adequately supported by the data shown?
If not, please explain in your comments to the authors.

Unable to assess

Are you able to assess any statistics in the manuscript or would you recommend an additional statistical review?
If an additional statistical review is recommended, please specify what aspects require further assessment in your comments to the editors.

Not relevant to this manuscript

Quality of written English
Please indicate the quality of language in the manuscript:

Needs some language corrections before being published
Declaration of competing interests
Please complete a declaration of competing interests, considering the following questions:

1. Have you in the past five years received reimbursements, fees, funding, or salary from an organisation that may in any way gain or lose financially from the publication of this manuscript, either now or in the future?

2. Do you hold any stocks or shares in an organisation that may in any way gain or lose financially from the publication of this manuscript, either now or in the future?

3. Do you hold or are you currently applying for any patents relating to the content of the manuscript?

4. Have you received reimbursements, fees, funding, or salary from an organization that holds or has applied for patents relating to the content of the manuscript?

5. Do you have any other financial competing interests?

6. Do you have any non-financial competing interests in relation to this paper?

If you can answer no to all of the above, write 'I declare that I have no competing interests' below. If your reply is yes to any, please give details below.

I declare that I have no competing interests

I agree to the open peer review policy of the journal. I understand that my name will be included on my report to the authors and, if the manuscript is accepted for publication, my named report including any attachments I upload will be posted on the website along with the authors' responses. I agree for my report to be made available under an Open Access Creative Commons CC-BY license (http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/). I understand that any comments which I do not wish to be included in my named report can be included as confidential comments to the editors, which will not be published.

I agree to the open peer review policy of the journal