Reviewer’s report

Title: Is preoperative MRCP necessary for patients with gallstones? An analysis of the factors related to missed diagnosis of choledocholithiasis by preoperative ultrasound

Version: 2
Date: 14 June 2015

Reviewer: Ajay Belgaumkar

Reviewer’s report:

Major Revisions:

The introduction is too long. Please reference the latest Cochrane reviews regarding diagnosis of gallstones and CBD stones. There is no need to give references such as Pg2 Line 26 stating that "laparoscopic cholecystectomy is the gold standard for treatment of gallstones".

The multiple detailed references regarding utility of MRCP are all from studies conducted in populations with a much lower incidence of CBD stones and may not be relevant to the study population.

The aim of the study is stated but it would be preferable, rather than stating the aim is to determine what factors predict an inaccurate ultrasound, to explain that the study aims to find predictive factors for patients who would benefit from MRCP. There is also no context given, regarding the desirability of pre-op detection with MRCP rather than intraoperative detection with Intra op cholangiogram.

The Statistical methods include the univariate analysis was performed to look for factors predictive of either diagnosing or missing CBD stones on USS and shows that CBD diameter, raised ALT and the presence of acute cholecystitis were the main factors. There is no attempt at constructing a multivariate model to predict failure of USS (or need for MRCP).

The correlations do not have any obvious relevance.

Results: Table 1 is redundant, as is Table 3.

Conclusion:
see above.

Level of interest: An article of limited interest

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: Yes, but I do not feel adequately qualified to assess the statistics.
Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests.