Reviewer's report

Title: The role of cytoplasmic p57 in invasion of hepatocellular carcinoma

Version: 2  Date: 8 April 2015

Reviewer: Catia Giovannini

Reviewer's report:

This manuscript by Guo et al investigates the role of cytoplasmic p57 in hepatocellular carcinoma (HCC). The paper contains some interesting observations but it is rather descriptive. The authors tried to demonstrate that cytoplasmic p57 is involved in HCC invasion however, no invasion assay are reported in the manuscript to demonstrate the role of p57 in this mechanism.

Several points need to be addressed:

a) Figure 1A has to be replaced, cytoplasmic staining is moderate and look like background.

b) Figure 1: magnification can’t be 400x as described in the methods.

c) Authors need to show p57 and p-cofilin staining in the same area at least in three HCC cases and surrounding non tumour tissues.

d) Figure 2A: p57 expression in BEL7402 and SMMC7721 cells is not moderate but high.

e) In methods authors report two shRNA sequence for p57 silencing however, throughout the manuscript only one shRNA is reported. Both shRNA-p57 have to be used in at least some experiments to role out off-target effects.

f) Figure 2D does not show difference in LIMK1 expression in p57 silenced cells compared to NC cells.

g) Figure 3A: BEL7402-shp57 are not silenced since no difference in p57 expression is evident between sh-p57 and shNC cells.

h) Figure 3B: an internal housekeeping control is necessary also for nuclear proteins (for example Histones).

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interest's.