Reviewer's report

Title: Early stage signet ring cell carcinoma of the colon examined by magnifying endoscopy with narrow-band imaging: a case report

Version: 2  Date: 6 May 2015

Reviewer: Ying Yuan

Reviewer's report:

Major Compulsory Revisions

1. Signet ring cell carcinoma of colon is rare, and early stage is even more unusual. This case presented an early stage primary signet ring cell carcinoma of cecum, which is really rare. Additionally, this case had a history of early gastric cancer six years ago. This double primary cancer patient may have some kind of gene defect or heredity disease. If possible, the family history should provide, may it be a case of HNPCC?

2. You can also take some relative gene test, such as STK11, P53, CHEK2, APC, BRCA1, CDH1 (or E-cadherin) et al, to find out whether this patient have gene defect or not, or other syndrome?

3. The technology of magnifying endoscopy with NBI and crystal violet staining has been commonly used in clinical practice for several years. Though this case provided the features under NBI magnifying endoscopy, the findings of signet ring cell carcinoma of colon are similar to those of gastric signet ring cell carcinoma. So the describe of technological finding should not be so important, you could cut down some.

4. The diagnostic and treatment process of this case did not conformed to the guidelines. Once a lesion was seen under the endoscopy, the biopsy was the first step and pathologic diagnosis should be confirmed firstly. No matter the carcinoma was confined in the mucosal layer or not, ESD was not recommended for colon cancer in NCCN guidelines. A radical resection should be suggested.

Level of interest: An article of limited interest

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests