Reviewer’s report

Title: Effect of bone marrow-derived mesenchymal stem cells on hepatic fibrosis in a thioacetamide-induced cirrhotic rat model

Version: 3
Date: 10 June 2014

Reviewer: Jonel Trebicka

Reviewer’s report:

The authors have analyzed the role of BM-MSC in the regression of fibrosis. They injected human BM-MSC directly intrahepatically and could show a decrease in fibrosis after two injections.

major comments:
1. the topic is not novel and the methods used neither. However, it confirms that BM-MSC might play a role in the therapy of fibrosis. Indeed several points need to be addressed before publication. On my opinion more efforts should be invested in the analysis of fibrolysis. what happens to the different MMPs and TIMPs, etc.
2. Teh model of TAA in rats with i.p. injections sounds difficult, however the authros show severe fibrosis. do the rats develop ascites?
3. what did the control group receive? the control groups should also receive a cellular suspension
4. did the authros used analog liver segments for hydroxy prolin? which segemnts, where teh injection is? this must be clear
5. where did the BM-MSC end up? teh authros should stain the livers for human antigens and analyze their location
6. what happens to the laboratory tests and blood tests? did the authors noticed more inflammatory infiltrates in teh liver?

minor comments:
1. the basal data as liver weight, body weight, spleen weight etc must be shown
2. the laboratory data (liver and blood) should be shown
3. the Spleen and other orgens should be analyze to see whtehr the cells migrate

Level of interest: An article of limited interest

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:
no competing interest