Author’s response to reviews

Title: Feasibility of implementing routine nutritional screening (MNA-SF) for older adults in Australian General Practices: A mixed-methods study

Authors:

Aliza H Hamirudin (ahh308@uowmail.edu.au)
Karen E Charlton (karenc@uow.edu.au)
Karen Walton (kwalton@uow.edu.au)
Jan Potter (jan.potter@sesiahs.health.nsw.gov.au)
Marianna Milosavljevic (Marianna.Milosavljevic@SESIAHS.HEALTH.NSW.GOV.AU)
George Albert (albert@smcentre.com.au)
Adam Hodgkins (adam@hodgkins.com.au)
Abhijeet Ghosh (aghosh@isml.org.au)
Andrew Dalley (andrewdalley@exemail.com.au)
Andrew Bonney (abonney@uow.edu.au)

Version: 4 Date: 23 October 2014

Author’s response to reviews: see over
Dear Dr Paolo Giorgi Rossi,

Authors’ response to editor for BMC Family Practice MS: 1540041924133132 entitled “Feasibility of implementing routine nutritional screening (MNA-SF) for older adults in Australian General Practices: A mixed-methods study” (Revision 2).

Thankyou for the opportunity to address the remaining outstanding issue in this third version of our paper. We trust that we have answered your query, as outlined below.

Dear Authors,

The comment by first reviewer about the use of quotes has been not received. Actually I do not completely agree with the reviewers and with the editorial on the ANZPHJ. In fact, qualitative studies are not aimed at determining if the majority or of the interviewed agree or not, but are useful to capture points of view and positions that could not be pre-determined in a quantitative questionnaire. Quotes can therefore be useful to describe the mood of some positions present in the interviewed people, we do not know if they are the majority or not and we should not draw conclusions from this qualitative representation of the reality about the quantitative relevance of the phenomenon.

From this point of view I think that your analysis is a convincing temptative to identify general themes and to give some examples of the intonation of the statements. The problem is: are the sentences reported an exhaustive (even if not quantitative) representation of the revealed moods (intonations) about that theme? In the methods you should give some indication on how you chose the sentences.

The use of quotes / sentences has been added in detail using track changes in methods section (page 8, line 20-25) as below:

‘An iterative process for topics coding involved constant comparison, whilst themes emerged according to topics coding [37]. AHH undertook the initial topics coding through constant comparison, and AHH, KC and KW performed secondary coding and thematic analysis before circulation to all team members for further discussion and consensus. Quotes selected for reporting were chosen based on the most profound quotes in findings [38] and from various participants to demonstrate reliability of the analysis [39].’

Kind regards

Associate Professor Karen Charlton