Author’s response to reviews

Title: A prospective, observational cohort study of patients presenting to an Emergency Department with acute shoulder trauma: The Manchester Emergency Shoulder (MeSH) project

Authors:

Michael Callaghan (michael.callaghan@mmu.ac.uk)
Janos Baombe (baombejp@yahoo.co.uk)
Daniel Horner (daniel.norner@srht.nhs.uk)
Charles Hutchinson (c.e.hutchinson@warwick.ac.uk)
Dilraj Sandher (dilrajsandher@me.com)
Simon Carley (simon.carley@cmft.nhs.uk)

Version: 3 Date: 2017-11-01

Author’s response to reviews:

1. For all research involving human subjects, informed consent to participate in the study should be obtained from participants (or their parent or legal guardian in the case of children under 16) and a statement to this effect should appear in the manuscript. Please confirm whether informed consent, written or verbal, was obtained from all participants and clearly state this in your manuscript. If verbal, please state the reason and whether the ethics committee approved this procedure. If the need for consent was waived by an IRB or is deemed unnecessary according to national regulations, please clearly state this, including the name of the IRB or a reference to the relevant legislation.

1 R: THIS IS ALREADY IN THE TEXT - METHODS LINE 120

2. We note that table one contains potentially identifiable information. It is BioMed Central policy to not publish more than 2 indirect identifiers without explicit consent for publication from the participants, as per this paper (http://trialsjournal.biomedcentral.com/articles/10.1186/1745-6215-11-9).
Currently, the age and gender information, in combination with other identifiers, may compromise patient/participant anonymity.

Please amend table 1 to address this issue, by removing the sex column and provide age ranges.

2 R: THESE COLUMNS HAVE NOW BEEN DELETED AND AGE RANGE AND GENDER DISTRIBUTION PROVIDED IN THE TEXT LINE 147

3. We would also like to ask for you to provide more justification for the contributions of Jonas Baomble and Dilraj Sandher as currently they do not automatically qualify for authorship. Contribution to the manuscript alone, does not usually justify authorship.

An 'author' is generally considered to be someone who has made substantive intellectual contributions to a published study. According to the ICMJE guidelines, to qualify as an author one should have:

a) made substantial contributions to conception and design, or acquisition of data, or analysis and interpretation of data; AND

b) been involved in drafting the manuscript or revising it critically for important intellectual content; AND

c) given final approval of the version to be published. Each author should have participated sufficiently in the work to take public responsibility for appropriate portions of the content; AND
d) agreed to be accountable for all aspects of the work in ensuring that questions related to the accuracy or integrity of any part of the work are appropriately investigated and resolved.

Anyone listed as an author must be included in this section. If you choose to change your author list you will need to fill out a change in authorship form and send it by email to the Editorial office to be approved by the Editor. The form can be found here: https://www.biomedcentral.com/getpublished/editorial-policies#authorship.

Anyone who contributed towards the article who does not meet the criteria for authorship can be acknowledged in the ‘Acknowledgements’ section

3 R; THIS SECTION HAS BEEN AMENDED ACCORDINGLY TO JUSTIFY THE INCLUSION OF ALL AUTHORS. APOLOGIES FOR THIS OVERSIGHT.

4. In the Funding section, please also describe the role of the funding body in the design of the study and collection, analysis, and interpretation of data and in writing the manuscript.

4 R; THE TEXT NOW DESCRIBES IN FULL THE ROLE OF THE FUNDING BODY IN LINE 267.

5. We note that you have included figure captions for three figures in your manuscript, but no corresponding files have been included. Please upload these figure files or remove the figure captions from your manuscript.
5 R: THE FIGURE FILES WHICH ACCOMPANY THE CAPTIONS HAVE BEEN INCLUDED. APOLOGIES IF THESE WERE OMITTED IN THE PREVIOUS RESUBMISSION.

6. Please change the heading “Introduction” in your manuscript to “Background” in order to adhere to the journals guidelines.

6 R: THIS IS NOW CHANGED AS REQUESTED ON PAGE 4

7. At this stage, please upload your manuscript as a single, final, clean version that does not contain any tracked changes, comments, highlights, strikethroughs or text in different colours. All relevant tables/figures/additional files should also be clean versions. Figures (and additional files) should remain uploaded as separate files.