Reviewer’s report

Title: Morbidity and mortality in a population of patients affected by heart failure and chronic obstructive pulmonary disease: an observational study

Version: 0 Date: 11 Sep 2018

Reviewer: Rita Pavasini

Reviewer's report:

This is a simple study on a population with COPD and HF treated with IND/GLY, based on the analysis of a small sample size. I have some suggestion:

- Please quote PMID 27956645 in introduction about the role of BNP in patients with COPD.

- Please open what IND/GLY means and better specify the kind of drug it is, this is a journal for cardiologist and a more detailed description of the effect of Indacaterol/glycopirronium is necessary.

- Please better define the items explored in the CAT test

- The authors found no differences in LVEF. Do the author have also data about global longitudinal strain (GLS) of left or right ventricle? In PMID 29529225 GLS of patients after an MI with concomitant COPD had worse outcome if with reduced GLS and was more informative than LVEF. GLS could be a more sensitive parameter to test an improvement in echo also in patients with COPD and HF treated with IND/GLY.

- Was there a difference between the two groups in the respiratory therapy?

- Please merge table 2 and 3 in just one table, but with analysis of the distribution of respiratory therapy also according to baseline and 6 month.

- How was managed the IND/GLY with other respiratory medicine?

- Please show p value also in table 1

- A study flow chart could be helpful to understand the study design

- Could you provide a figure/table about the change in spirometry parameters?
Please quote in the discussion PMID 28821412: this study shows that patients treated with ICS/LABD had a less severe manifestation of the acute phase of STEMI. Could the administration of corticosteroids have had an influence on results obtained?

**Are the methods appropriate and well described?**
If not, please specify what is required in your comments to the authors.

Yes

**Does the work include the necessary controls?**
If not, please specify which controls are required in your comments to the authors.

Yes

**Are the conclusions drawn adequately supported by the data shown?**
If not, please explain in your comments to the authors.

Yes

**Are you able to assess any statistics in the manuscript or would you recommend an additional statistical review?**
If an additional statistical review is recommended, please specify what aspects require further assessment in your comments to the editors.

I am able to assess the statistics

**Quality of written English**
Please indicate the quality of language in the manuscript:

Acceptable

**Declaration of competing interests**
Please complete a declaration of competing interests, considering the following questions:

1. Have you in the past five years received reimbursements, fees, funding, or salary from an organisation that may in any way gain or lose financially from the publication of this manuscript, either now or in the future?

2. Do you hold any stocks or shares in an organisation that may in any way gain or lose financially from the publication of this manuscript, either now or in the future?

3. Do you hold or are you currently applying for any patents relating to the content of the manuscript?

4. Have you received reimbursements, fees, funding, or salary from an organization that holds or has applied for patents relating to the content of the manuscript?
5. Do you have any other financial competing interests?

6. Do you have any non-financial competing interests in relation to this paper?

If you can answer no to all of the above, write 'I declare that I have no competing interests' below. If your reply is yes to any, please give details below.

I declare that I have no competing interests

I agree to the open peer review policy of the journal. I understand that my name will be included on my report to the authors and, if the manuscript is accepted for publication, my named report including any attachments I upload will be posted on the website along with the authors' responses. I agree for my report to be made available under an Open Access Creative Commons CC-BY license (http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/). I understand that any comments which I do not wish to be included in my named report can be included as confidential comments to the editors, which will not be published.

I agree to the open peer review policy of the journal.