Reviewer's report

Title: Using clinical parameters to guide fluid therapy in high-risk thoracic surgery. A retrospective, observational study

Version: 2 Date: 11 April 2015

Reviewer: yalim dikmen

Reviewer's report:

Major revision
This manuscript reports the result of implementation of intraoperative hemodynamic goal directed therapy during pneumonectomy operations. This study has several limitations like the before after design and low subject number, but it shows an indication of better short term outcomes in the goal directed therapy group. However there are some points need to be clarified.

On my point of view the most important problem is the lack of information on why the patients in the after group had a significantly lower intensive care length of stay. As the discharge criteria had not been changed during the study period there would be some parameters that would have shown better in the after group for early discharge. I think why this group of patients had a shorter ICU stay can not be seen in the manuscript. Perhaps a comparison of blood gas analysis, respiratory functions, level of consciousness would give better clues for why these patients had been better.

Another point is the choice of ScVO2 threshold of 60 % for hemodynamic interventions. Although limited, there are perioperative data, which show a ScVO2 value below 70-73% is associated with low tissue perfusion and increased risk of postoperative complications.

and


Therefore the argument of preventing hypervolemia by choosing a lower ScVO2 level seems not to be valid, and this issue needs further discussion.

Level of interest: An article of limited interest

Quality of written English: Acceptable
Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests: 
I declare the I have no competing interests