Reviewer’s report

Title: Match play performance characteristics that predict post-match creatine kinase responses in professional rugby union players

Version: 1 Date: 11 July 2014

Reviewer: Chris Mclellan

Reviewer’s report:

General Comments:
The manuscript attempts to present a unique analysis of creatine kinase responses to professional rugby union match-play using micro-technology in the form of portable Global Positioning System (GPS) units and manufacturer software. In its present format the manuscript presents a vague narrative and fails to meet the scientific research and presentation quality befitting the standards of the BMC Sports Science, Medicine and Rehabilitation Research. The manuscript contains multiple content and grammatical errors and methodological flaws that make the paper weak and compromise the meaningfulness of data presented.

The methods section contains large number of fundamental methodological flaws that make the paper weak. The interval of CK sample collection fails to determine peak CK in accordance with the body of evidence associated with the literature and as such the author postulates several unsubstantiated conclusions from the data presented. No information is provided with respect to what is constituted by ‘impacts’ resulting in the authors attempting to generalize match-play impacts in a narrow and erroneous manner that lends all subsequent discussion and conclusion speculative at best. No information is provided with respect to what participants did between CK sample collection at 16hr and 40hr thereby providing no reasonable justification for the data to be accepted on its merits.

The discussion needs to reflect what was found, how it relates to the literature and then what it means physiologically or from a practical perspective given the applied nature of the research.

Level of interest: An article of limited interest

Quality of written English: Not suitable for publication unless extensively edited

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:
I declare that I have no competing interests