Reviewer's report

Title: Return to Sport after Arthroscopic Meniscectomy on Stable Knees

Version: 3 Date: 14 August 2012

Reviewer number: 4

Reviewer's report:

Major Compulsory Revisions
1. Why "30 yr old" is selected as the cut off point for young and old group? Any regression analysis or other reasoning behind?

2. Any difference and relation between the site and pattern of tear (anterior, mid or posterior horn, complex vs simple tear)?

3. What is the reason for recurrent pain and effusion? Any hindsight after the re-cope?

4. Can you postulate why a larger resection will result in earlier return to activity?

Discretionary Revisions
1. What is the rehabilitative protocol after surgery? Please elaborate

Level of interest: An article of limited interest

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Statistical review: Yes, but I do not feel adequately qualified to assess the statistics.