Reviewer's report

Title: Return to Sport after Arthroscopic Meniscectomy on Stable Knees

Version: 3 Date: 10 August 2012

Reviewer number: 3

Reviewer's report:

This subject is worthy of study. However, no controversy is identified to create much interest. The purpose is clearly stated. No hypothesis is given.

It is not clear what “to be able to return” mean. Does it mean return to sports with or without pain, effusion and weakness?

What does “partial meniscectomy” mean? When the posterior horn of the medial meniscus is totally removed and the hoop effect is lost, is it total or partial meniscectomy?

It is stated “The resumption of sports activity was permitted four weeks after surgery”. According to which criteria is the resumption of sports permitted? Why not permit sports at two or six weeks?

How were the patients followed up? How do the patients and the author record the date of return to sports? When a patient felt able to return to sport but rested for one more month, how do you document the time interval?

“The return-to-sport” is not clearly defined. Does it mean “try to return to sports”, “return to sports with symptoms”, “return to sports without symptoms but at lower activity level”, “return to sports without symptoms at the same preinjury activity level”, or “try but fail to return to sports”?

From the introduction, the purpose of this study is to answer the patients when they were allowed to return to sports. So the answer depends more on the surgeon, because each surgeon believe in different rehabilitation protocol. Some may tell the patients to return to sports immediately after operation, and some may permit them doing at quite a longer time postoperatively. Thus, the results of this study will not be so meaningful.

The author categorized the activity level into three. This is not a reasonable way to record activity. Why not use the more widely-accepted Lysholm and Tegner, IKDC subjective or WOMAC scale?

Level of interest: An article of limited interest

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a
statistician.