Reviewer's report

Title: Mortality attributable to tobacco: Review of different methods

Version: 2
Date: 10 December 2013

Reviewer: Edwin Pelfrene

Reviewer's report:

I. Minor Essential Revisions

They all apply to some language details:

1. Introduction, paragraph 4 (§4): ... Unless urgent action is taken, tobacco's annual death will rise ... -> death toll will rise ...

2. Materials and methods, §1: Search terms were used, including ... ; "smoking" and the key words "tobacco". -> ..., "smoking", in combination with the key word "tobacco".

3. Materials and methods, §1, last sentence: ... in Canada USA and Portugal -> in Canada, USA and Portugal.

4. Materials and methods, §2, first sentence: The main .. the use of modelization to estimate ... -> the use of modelling to estimate ... (in American English also 'modeling' is used, as I may learn from a dictionary).

5. Materials and methods, §2, last sentence: No restriction was taking into account ... -> was taken into account

6. Materials and methods, §3, first sentence: A total of 186 articles were found, ... since they used modelization to estimate -> modelling/modelling methods

7. Materials and methods, §3, last sentence: As a result of this first review, a further 12 articles ... were included in the analysis. -> As a result, 12 articles published between 1998 and 2005 were included in the analysis.

8. Materials and methods, §3, first sentence: The following information's ... -> The following items ...

9. Results and discussion, Type of models and used methods, §1: ... The applied methodology ... : ... -> : prevalence-based analysis in cohort studies (SAMMEC method), prevalence-based analysis in case-control studies, smoking impact ratio method.

10. Results and discussion, Type of models and used methods, § at the end of the section: The second step of this process consists of computing ..., by age group and sex, as per the CPS II. -> as per the CPS II:

11. Results and discussion, Type of models and used methods, last §: The last
step in this procedure would involve applyig -> applying

12. Results and discussion, Smoking attributable mortality, §2, .. and 3% of total mortality in women (380000 deaths). -> (380 000 deaths).

13. Discussion, §3, first sentence: The first limitation affecting ... stems from the use of different methodological approach -> stems from the use of a different ...

14. Discussion, §4, middle: In Israel, ... using a lagged approach - wich took into account .. -> which

15. Discussion, §4, near the end: In Israel, ... of 50% on the SAMMEC categories [21].The opposite occurs .. -> ... [21]. The opposite ...

16. References, Ref1: the title is not in bold case? Is it in any way different from the other references?

17. References, Ref10: Pru¨ss-Ustu¨¨n can be dropped.

18. References, Ref24: Wen C P, Tai S P, ... -> Wen CP, Tai SP, ...

19. Table 1: the final point in the title of the table can be dropped.

20. Table 3: Mal/Femal -> Male/Female

II. Discretionally Revisions

1.

Introduction, §2:

"Among risk factors for non-communicable diseases, tobacco is enemy number one (WHO, 2000). It is the most important established cause of cancer but also responsible for cardiovascular and chronic respiratory diseases." ->

To be "the most important established cause" is quite a general and bold statement, which might be difficult to prove.

An alternative could be: It is a widely established cause of cancer, and moreover, also responsible for cardiovascular and chronic respiratory diseases.

I leave it to the authors to consider the point raised.

2.

Results and Discussion, Type of models and used methods, i. Prevalence-based analysis in cohort studies (SAMMEC), §1, middle:

"The first step is selecting the most relevant smoking related pathologies and fow which reliable data existed."

Alternative to consider ->
"The first step consists in selecting the most relevant smoking related pathologies for which reliable data are available."

3.
Results and Discussion, Type of models and used methods, i. Prevalence-based analysis in cohort studies (SAMMEC), $1, last sentence:
"The second step was establishing the quantitative relationship between smoking and the pathologies in question."

Alternative ->
"The second step establishes the quantitative relationship between smoking and the selected pathologies."

4.
Discussion, §3, middle:
"... All these factors influence the results of the attributable mortality. The second limitation resides in the absence ...

To consider ->
"... All these factors influence the results of the attributable mortality. The second limitation resides in the absence ...

5.
Discussion, §4, middle:
"Knowing current smoking prevalence could be a great help when it comes to predicting future mortality, but not present."

To consider ->
"Knowing current smoking prevalence could be a great help when it comes to predicting future mortality, it might fail however with respect to the present mortality."

6.
Finally, in the cover letter, an alternative title was suggested:
“Smoking-attributable mortality in Morocco: Results of a prevalence-based study in Casablanca"

I have some difficulties to see the relationship with the article presented.

The title "Mortality attributable to tobacco: Review of different methods" is definitely more valid.
Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:
I declare that I have no competing interests.