Reviewer’s report

Title: Unusual presentation of Lynch Syndrome

Version: 1 Date: 20 March 2009

Reviewer: anja wagner

Reviewer’s report:

It is a nice case report, showing good clinical workup.

major compulsory revisions

In results cosegregation of the mutation in 9 affected relatives is mentioned but in the pedigree I can find 7 relatives (including 2 obligate carriers) and one unaffected and also a spouse is indicated to have the mutation. I assume the figure is wrong, otherwise the discussion must be different and the pathogenicity of the mutation will be less certain.

I also miss a clear table with the tumours that show IHC aberrations, since based on this the causative relation of the mutation to the tumours is assumed. Prostate cancer and cervical cancer are common tumours and can also rise easily sporadic. So these data should be specified and shown. Showing LOH of the non-mutated allele can also underscore the role of this mutation in the tumours and would add largely to the evidence that the variant is pathogenic.

I think this is a normal Lynch family with an uncommon clustering of other tumours in one branch of the family, especially in the index patient. I think one must seriously consider other risk factors in this branch of the family. Did father drink/smoke? Gastroscopy based on one oesophageal cancer is not indicated. The usefulness of advising prostate screening for all mutation carriers can also be doubted and may be limited to this branch of the family.

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable