Reviewer's report

Title: Prevalence and predictors of germline CDKN2A mutations for melanoma cases from Australia, Spain and the United Kingdom

Version: 1 Date: 15 September 2014

Reviewer: Robert McWilliams

Reviewer's report:

Overall, this is a well written manuscript, with reasonable conclusions. My comments are minor.

Specific comments:

Page 7, end of 2nd paragraph: With regard to recruitment of participants, it states "Cases were asked about family history of melanoma and previous melanomas". What about controls?

Overall, the authors give a reasonable self-sritique of the limitations of the 3 different types of ascertainment of cases and controls. However, the mutation frequencies among unselected cases were remarkably similar. This is addressed well in the discussion.

The tables are reasonable

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

I do not have any competing interests