Reviewer’s report

Title: Retear of Anterior Cruciate Ligament Graft in Female Basketball Players

Version: 1 Date: 13 December 2009

Reviewer number: 2

Reviewer’s report:

I am sure there is some useful information in this paper. Especially, it showed that the ACL retear occurred in 9.4% of the female young basketball players with anatomical double bundle reconstruction. The authors suggested some risk factors of retear, which was caused by the weakness of quadriceps muscle strength or preoperative period from injury. They cautioned the patients not to be returned earlier to previous injured level of their playing basketball.

I have the following comments to make:

Page 7: Surgical Procedure.
The authors should describe about the tension of graft and knee angle position at fixation when the anatomical double bundle reconstruction was performed. The failure of graft was often caused by excessive strength.

Page 8: Postoperative Rehabilitation and Return to Basketball.
The patients were allowed to return to previous basketball activity from 8 months after surgery. However, the muscle strength evaluation was performed at 6 month after surgery and this muscle strength test at 6 month was applied to be one of risk factor for detecting the difference between two groups. The patients would be trained individually after this evaluation without activity control. Did you recommend the patients perform athletic rehabilitation like agility, jump or balanced exercise? Can you describe about the rehabilitation during 2 month to clear the difference between two groups?

Page 12: Considering the presence of ACL insufficiency,

The authors suggested the weak point in this paper, that functional assessment was lacked for evaluation of ACL insufficiency. Did you have any proprioceptive or performance data even at 6 month after surgery, like one leg hop test?

This paper should need to be major revision including correction for the wrong use of terms.

Level of interest: An article of limited interest

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published
**Statistical review:** No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.