Reviewer's report

Title: Retear of Anterior Cruciate Ligament Graft in Female Basketball Players

Version: 1 Date: 3 December 2009

Reviewer number: 1

Reviewer's report:

General comments
The authors are discussing the interesting theme that re-injury after ACL reconstruction in female basketball players. The authors showed 6 cases of re-tear, and the high rate of re-injury after returning to play basketball. However, because of relatively small number, their objective to clarify risk factor for re-tear of the reconstructed graft became difficult to archive. This paper would be better to reorganized as a case series rather than comparative studies.

Questions and Comments: Please put page numbers on each page of the paper.

INTRODUCTION
1) One opinion says that ACL reconstruction has not been accepted to restore the knee function in long term, in terms of preventing OA change after ACL reconstruction. Could you comment on this?

PATIENTS and METHODS
Patients
2) Could you explain “because of social background”?

Surgical procedure
3) Do authors usually use two hamstring grafts (Semi-T and gracillis)?

Rehabilitation
4) Is there any criteria for returning basketball beside Quad-Ham strength?
5) Any Neuro-muscular training rehabilitation prescribed?

RESULTS
Incidence
6) Is there any difference among the return level?

DISCUSSION
7) Retear group has shorter period of before surgery, and increased weakness in Quad force. Please give us reasonable explanation for correlation between pre-operative muscle weakness and ACL re-tear 8 month after operation?
8) The authors mention about flexibility, agility, jump performance, and so on with
no data on rehabilitation. Please give us more information on rehabilitation in detail or shorten speculation about rehabilitation.

9) Limitation of this study should include relatively small number of retear group.

**Level of interest:** An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

**Quality of written English:** Not suitable for publication unless extensively edited