Reviewer's report

Title: Painful knee joint after ACL reconstruction using biodegradable interference screws- SPECT/CT a valuable diagnostic tool? A case report

Version: 1 Date: 27 June 2010

Reviewer number: 1

Reviewer's report:

Page 3, line 13-: “Offering similar fixation strength and outcome as metall interference screws these promise to cause less graft damage at insertion,” “metal” should be “metal”.

Page 3, line 14-: “Offering similar fixation strength and outcome as metall interference screws these promise to cause less graft damage at insertion, less artifacts in magnetic resonance imaging and generally no removal of the screws is necessitated.” The authors should refer previously reported studies which reveal that biodegradable interference screws cause less graft damage at insertion.

Page 3, last line 3-: “In most orthopaedic units current diagnostic follow-up in patients having problems after ACL reconstruction include clinical examination, standardized radiographs, computerized tomography (CT), magnetic resonance imaging (MRI) and probably single photon emission tomography (SPECT) [20-22].” Most orthopaedic units current diagnostic follow-up in patients having problems after ACL reconstruction do not use single photon emission tomography (SPECT). Please delete “single photon emission tomography (SPECT)” in this sentence, if the authors agree.

Page 5, line 11- : “The MRI showed an ACL graft in continuity, a possible tibial cyclops lesion and a patella infera. There was no increased fluid collection within the bone tunnels.” There is no “Figure 1” in the text. Please inset “Fig 1”. I cannot see where a possible tibial cyclops lesion is located in the MRI images in figure 1. Please point the area which the authors consider is a possible tibial cyclops lesion in the MRI images in figure 1.

Page 5, paragraph 3: There is no “Figure 2” in the text. Please inset “Fig 2” in the text.

Page 5, line 17-: “In addition, the femoral bone showed a diffuse patchy osteopenia.” Do the images of the 99mTc-HDP-SPECT/CT suggest a diffuse patchy osteopenia in the femoral bone? Please point the diffuse patchy osteopenia in the images of the 99mTc-HDP-SPECT/CT using arrows.

Page 6, line 3-: “The Milagro™ interference screws were removed, the ACL graft debrided and an arthrolysis, in particular of the anterior patellar ligament interval performed.” Please rewrite this sentence to “The Milagro™ interference screws
were removed, we performed debridement of the ACL graft and an arthrolysis, in particular of the anterior patellar ligament interval.”

Page 6, line 4-: “The histological examination (fig. 4) of the degraded screw material and removed fibrous tissue showed typical findings of a foreign body reaction.” Please retouch figure 4 to easily show findings of a foreign body reaction, e.g. foreign body giant cell using arrows.

Page 6, line 10: “Conclusion” should be “Discussion”.

Page 6, line 16-: “According to Frosch et al. 18 months after ACL reconstruction one could expect that the used interference screws were entirely degraded and partially incorporated.” Please put the reference number.

Page 6, line 18-: “The authors investigated the in vivo degradation and biocompatibility of the same interference screw as in our case report. In a series of 12 patients after arthroscopic ACL reconstruction using hamstring tendon grafts serial MR imaging was performed at 3, 6 and 12 months after surgery.” Please refer this paper as a reference and put the reference number in the text.

Page 6, line 20-: “The average volume loss of the tibial and femoral screws were 83±17% and 92±6%, respectively.” When? Is it at 3 months or 6 months?

Figures: The authors should extensively retouch figures to easily make readers understand the findings in MRI, 99mTc-HDP-SPECT/CT, 3D-CT, and histology.

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published