Reviewer's report

Title: Synovial chondromatosis originating from the synovium of the anterior cruciate ligament: A Case Report

Version: 1 Date: 8 March 2009

Reviewer number: 2

Reviewer's report:

I think that this is a very interesting case and merits publication, largely on the grounds of educational purposes, in notifying of a rare but important diagnostic consideration for the patient presenting with a locked knee. The diagnosis is well supported by histological diagnosis, and the followup period is adequate.

I have only 2 comments/questions regarding the content of the article:
Firstly, I would ask the authors whether or not they, or their radiologists, could now make the diagnosis retrospectively on the MRI scan, and whether this has therefore perhaps led to a potential improvement in preoperative diagnosis?

The other questions relates to paragraph 2 of the discussion, which I found a little unclear. They present 2 possible etiologies, and it seems as though they conclude it relates to "freed cartilaginous fragments generated around the ACL". If so could they comment on what they believe to be the origin of these fragments e.g. did they find any significant chondral lesions at the time of arthroscopy.

I would like them to address these questions in their results and/or discussion prior to acceptance for publication, otherwise there are no other issues with the article content.

The article is however in need of significant revisions for the English, which includes a number of grammatical and spelling errors.

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published